



# LATIN LITURGY

The Journal of the Association for Latin Liturgy  
No 163 – Ascension 2023

*Latin Liturgy and Gregorian Chant for the Church of today*



*22<sup>nd</sup> October 2022: Mass in St Mary's Twickenham University Chapel.*



*Schola at the Mass, directed by Fr Guy Nicholls.*

## **Contents**

October 7 <sup>th</sup> : Open Meeting and 2023 AGM, at Our Lady and the English Martyrs in Cambridge .....	3
Renewing your subscription .....	3
Report on ALL Day Conference at St Mary's University, Twickenham, 22 <sup>nd</sup> October 2022.....	4
Reports from the Chairman and Treasurer.....	8
Sermon preached on the Memoria of St John Paul II.....	10
<i>Sed non Martha...Nec Maria</i> .....	13
The funeral Mass of Pope Emeritus Benedict .....	20
<i>Doctrina Romanensium de purgatorio</i> .....	21
July 8th 2023: the Bede Lecture, at Ealing Abbey .....	23
<i>Notae Latinae</i> .....	24
Appendix: Accounts 2021 – 2022.....	26



## **Open Meeting and 2023 AGM**

We are pleased to announce that our principal meeting of this year will take place on **Saturday October 7<sup>th</sup>** at the church of Our Lady and the English Martyrs in Cambridge, by kind permission of the Rector, Mgr Eugene Harkness. A detailed timetable and a booking form for the day will appear in our next edition.

The plan is to begin mid-morning with Solemn Mass for the feast of Our Lady of the Rosary, with the Proper from the *Graduale Parvum* and a polyphonic Ordinary, probably Byrd's *Mass for Five Voices*. After lunch there will be a talk by Bishop Emeritus Alan Hopes, with questions and discussion, followed by the AGM (business meeting with election of Council etc) and the day will conclude with sung Latin Vespers and Benediction.

Members are asked to consider how very important it is that we have a good attendance at this meeting, since it was at OLEM that the ALL began its existence, in the tumultuous post-Conciliar period of the late 1960s. **So put the date in your diary now!**

Cambridge is easily accessible by train, and the station is within easy walking distance of the church. And if you are coming by car, there are no less than five Park and Ride venues around Cambridge.

## **Renewing your subscription**

Subscriptions for 2023 – 24 are now due, and you will find enclosed the Membership Renewal Form. Please use it if you renew annually by cheque. If you pay by standing order, please do ensure that it is for the correct amount, as follows:

UK Ordinary Subscription: £20.

Europe: £25 (£20 if receiving *Latin Liturgy* by email).

Outside Europe: £30 (£20 if receiving *Latin Liturgy* by email).

Priests, religious, under 18s, or students (UK and Europe) £12.

Students (worldwide): gratis (if receiving *Latin Liturgy* by email).

Joint Subscription (UK): £25 for two members living at the same address.

## **Report on the Day Conference held at St Mary's University, Twickenham in October 2022**

This Conference, held at St Mary's University, by kind invitation of the Vice-Chancellor, Anthony McClaran, an ALL member of long standing and previously a member of Council, was our most successful event for several years. We were welcomed, in a warm and friendly atmosphere, with coffee in the University's Dolce Vita café. Canon Peter Newby, the University's Chaplain, in conjunction with the Vice-Chancellor, had facilitated everything for us. The Association would especially like to thank them both, as without them the day would not have been possible, let alone become the great success it was.

In addition to ALL members, we also met our guests, of whom there were many. The Choir from the parish of St Thomas More, Bexleyheath, with its intense, vibrant singing, had a transformative effect on the music, notably their young solo cantor in the Communion chant. The singing was directed with aplomb by Fr Guy Nicholls, who had also composed, on the model of the *Graduale Parvum*, all the chants of the Proper. Mass was celebrated by Fr Lawrence Lew OP, assisted by Fr Anton Webb and by Canon Peter Newby, who also gave the sermon (which can be found later in this edition) on St John-Paul II, whose memoria was the feast of the day. On the sanctuary, two servers from Bexleyheath joined harmoniously with two from the University.

Fr Guy Nicholls had not only composed the Proper for the feast but also directed it, and the ordinary *Cum Iubilo*. In an unforeseen moment of hiatus before the Gospel, he also adroitly improvised an Alleluia *Tu es Petrus*, which seamlessly got us over an awkward moment! The organist was Peter Adams, who skilfully made the best of an instrument which is currently in a state of disrepair. Members will be glad to hear that the ALL has sent a

donation towards the fund for the complete rebuilding of the organ.

After Mass, members and guests moved to the Chaplaincy, where sherry was served before lunch, which was taken in the students' refectory amid much animated discussion. After lunch we held the Annual General Meeting in the splendid surroundings of the Waldegrave Drawing Room, which the Vice-Chancellor had kindly put at our disposal, and after some kind words of welcome, the Chairman then presented the vice-Chancellor with a set of ALL publications for the University Library. The business meeting was brief and to the point, beginning with the Annual Reports for 2021 – 2022 from the Chairman and Treasurer, which can be found following this account of the day. Elections to Council then took place, the proposed candidates being elected unopposed, and the meeting approved *nemine contradicente* the amendments to the Constitution of the Association, as proposed by Council.

Following this brief business meeting, we heard from our speakers, Professor Peter Tyler and the Revd Deacon Ian Coleman. Professor Tyler is Professor of Pastoral Theology and Spirituality at St Mary's, and is Director of the Centre of Initiatives in Spirituality and Reconciliation. Ian Coleman's fields of work range from Music to Theology with many things in between, and he is also a Permanent Deacon in the Archdiocese of Westminster. Their presentation was entitled 'The Carthusians: Spirituality and Liturgy'.

Professor Tyler gave an illuminating history of the Carthusians in England, including the erstwhile nearby Sheen Friary, and an exposition of their spirituality. He was followed by the Deacon Ian Coleman, who gave a moving account of other aspects of Carthusian life, particularly their music. The text of his address appears later in this edition, and Professor Tyler's talk will be printed in the next *Latin Liturgy*, later this year. Many illustrations were shown, striking among them being the graphic image (1903) of the

monks being expelled from the Grande Chartreuse by soldiers carrying out the dictates of the extreme anti-clerical French government.

There followed a short and much-appreciated tour, led by Professor Tyler, of the historic buildings of Strawberry Hill, now part of the University campus, and the day concluded with Benediction of the Blessed Sacrament, at which Canon Newby officiated, after which tea was taken in the Chaplaincy before our departure.

**Christopher Francis**

**Bernard Marriott adds:** “Later in the day, and not connected with the meeting, there was a piano recital in the Waldegrave Drawing Room given by Ian Coleman. It consisted of Janáček’s Three Moravian Dances, and then a series of ten piano pieces *On an overgrown path*. Ian had written poems to go after each piece, which were read by his son. Altogether a remarkable experience.”

**And Brendan Daintith,** our Membership Secretary, has written the following: “This is the first time since 2019 that we have been able to hold a ‘real’ meeting and it was encouraging to see a good turnout of members emerging from the confines of Covid restrictions. I think the most rewarding part of the day was listening to the choir. In the past we might have paid professional singers to perform elaborate Mass settings, but today we had a youthful parish choir from Bexleyheath who sang with fervour and great ability. It is so impressive to see what an ordinary parish can achieve, given some encouragement – and a supportive parish priest. This is of course one of the main aims of the Association. Altogether a most encouraging day.”

**Finally this, from the website of St Thomas More Church, Bexleyheath:** “Dear parishioners, Last Saturday our choir and servers went by train via Waterloo to St Mary’s University, Strawberry Hill, Twickenham. This is one of the last remaining Catholic universities in England, but is open

to all, and has always had a particular mission to provide university education to the poor. The oldest building is a fine example of early neo-Gothic with a splendid drawing room in which the Association for Latin Liturgy held its AGM in the afternoon. We also had a tour of the grounds and saw the running track where Mo Farah, as a student there, prepared for his later triumphs.

The university church overlooks the main square of the campus, up a flight of steps over the university library. The Church is a surprisingly elegant piece of 1960s architecture of brick in an early modernist style, with fine stained glass windows and a clear orientation, having been built just before extreme modernist and revolutionary styles took hold and churches became unrecognisable. Noteworthy too is a fine mosaic of the Blessed Virgin Mary given by the Vatican to the University in commemoration of our beloved Pope Benedict XVI's visit there.

On the other side of the campus square is a tiny gothic chapel of the Blessed Virgin Mary, and next to that the chaplaincy buildings, where drinks were served before lunch and, later on, afternoon tea. The university gave us an excellent lunch, but the highlight of the day was the ALL celebration of Mass for the memoria of St Pope John Paul II. In addition to servers for the Mass, St Thomas More parish provided the choir and soloists who sang the solo parts of the introit and communion. We had also put in a lot of practice of the Mass setting *Cum iubilo*, one of the most difficult, and led it confidently and well. Comments received afterwards include:

“My own impression was that this was probably one of the most upbeat meetings we have had, certainly in recent years and probably in the whole of the new Millennium... the choir show no sign of anything less than enthusiasm for the repertoire they are now getting used to singing, with some brio!”

There are some kinds of pride which it is good to have, and I certainly am proud of the achievements of St Thomas More organist, choir and the servers for their contribution to the ALL day, which they would not have done without commitment, practice and dedication over the last couple of years. Thank you for representing our parish so well!

If you are interested in singing Catholic chant for the Mass, you are welcome to join our choir. You cannot be too young or too old. It is not just a cliché, but ‘singing is good for the soul’ and is a great offering to God. Also, if you would like to find out more about or join the Association for Latin Liturgy, receive their bulletin and join us at future events...”

[Here follows guidance about joining the ALL. We are most grateful to Fr Jonathon Routh, the Parish Priest, for allowing us to quote his impressions of the day.]

### **Chairman’s Annual Report 2021 – 2022**

The Association marked its emergence from the great Covid Captivity by visiting the Church of St Joseph in Aldershot at the invitation of Fr Anthony Glaysher and Deacon Craig Aburn. There we celebrated Mass (with *Graduale Parvum* chants directed by Fr Guy Nicholls) and Benediction, and a paper entitled ‘Beyond Translation’ by Mgr Bruce Harbert was read.

But even before we were able to meet in person, Council member Paul Henriksen had arranged and directed live-streamed Mass and Vespers from Walsingham for the feast of Corpus Christi, celebrated by Mgr Philip Moger, Rector of the Shrine, who has since been ordained an Auxiliary Bishop of Southwark. The Annual General Meeting being for the second time impossible to hold ‘live’, an online/postal consultation was held in its place, by means of which the



election of officers and other members of Council was confirmed and the continuance of the Association's work assured.

The arguments over *Traditionis Custodes* continued widely and acrimoniously throughout the Church, but the Association quietly pursued its steady work in support of the contemporary liturgy in Latin, particularly by enlarging the scope of the *Graduale Parvum*, thanks to the creative and innovative work of Fr Guy Nicholls. In addition, the Advent edition of our journal *Latin Liturgy* carried a wide range of responses to the current 'Liturgy Disputes': 'Wars' seems too grandiose a term with which to dignify them. Moving into the current year [2022] a day of chant and conviviality was held at the Church of St Thomas More, Bexleyheath at the invitation of Fr Jonathon Routh, and a report on that appeared in *Latin Liturgy*.

So having emerged blinking into the light of the post-Covid day, we continue to be as enterprising as we can in our work, which is summarised neatly in our new mission statement: 'Latin liturgy and Gregorian chant for the Church of today'.

**Christopher Francis**

### **Treasurer's Annual Report 2021 – 2022**

The Accounts for 2021/22 (see appendix at the end of this issue) show a transformation from a loss of £828 the previous year to a surplus of £2,382. This has arisen from the preliminary costs of starting the preparation of the *Graduale Parvum* Communions occurring in 2020/21, as against the sale of our stock of Introits to the CTS in 2021/22. The CTS are now responsible for printing and distribution of the Introits.

The cost of the Mass at Walsingham and the meeting at Aldershot (£1,093) was offset by receipts (£458) from those having lunch at Aldershot. Overall we remain in a position where we can fund work on the *Graduale Parvum* in anticipation of income from sales following publication.

**Bernard Marriott**

**Sermon preached on the Memoria of St John Paul II, at  
the ALL Autumn Conference, St Mary's University,  
Twickenham, by the Chaplain, Canon Peter Newby**

I am old enough to remember Pope Paul VI, and indeed went to his funeral in August 1978 while working in Rome that summer. I had returned to Cambridge University before John Paul II was elected, after the short pontificate of John Paul I - but that is another story. Pope John Paul II's pontificate was formative for most priests who are now in their fifties, sixties and seventies. He set the tone for the renewal of the Church, and he set the tone for my own priesthood, as he did for that of countless others.

By taking the name of his immediate predecessor, who himself had taken the name of *his* two predecessors at his election in 1978, he emphasised that the guiding light of Vatican II still held. Pope John Paul II had been instrumental in the composition of *Gaudium et Spes*, in which he made clear the motif that Jesus Christ reveals men and women to themselves as his own. It was obvious to him that the Church was consuming itself from the inside, becoming a self-referential institution, which was not at all the intention of the Council or of Pope Paul VI.

His insight was the turning outwards by the Church to the world, a movement which could be explained through

personalist philosophy that moved from the universal concepts of Transcendental Thomism to the embodied personal categories of the continental tradition. This is of course not a philosophy class, but his shift of emphasis did not deny the past philosophical tradition of the Church

This authentic development of philosophical formation possessed an evangelistic potential. Jesus Christ comes into our lives through faith, and transforms life into a drama, the drama of our lives, of which the script is written in the light of revelation, in dialogue through prayer with Jesus Christ.

Pope Paul II saw the person in his or her historical and unique circumstances as the place of revelation, the place of choice, and the place of spiritual struggle. In this he addressed issues of universal human questioning, the reality of suffering, the questions of love, mercy and forgiveness, and the place of work. They were issues for our key audience, the university student, and for me the key to understanding his pontificate *is* the world of the university student.

I saw this first-hand during the Millennium celebrations, when I had the privilege of travelling to Rome both to prepare for and to celebrate the Jubilee of Universities. Pope John Paul II demonstrated obvious warmth to students, and he established World Youth Day for students. His own years as Chaplain to the Catholic University of Lublin made him aware of the role of the Church in sustaining a Christian culture, in distinction to the dead hand of Communism and shallowness of modern consumerism.

Personally, as University Chaplain in Oxford and here at St Mary's, the programme of his pontificate is deeply embedded in my own path of priesthood, though I must admit I came to it late after leaving Cambridge University in 1980; but now I see that all the questions which concerned me as an undergraduate were not answered in the secular world but *were* being answered within the Church.

So to me, Pope John Paul II speaks of the central concern to students: the purpose and meaning of life, and the relationship between faith and reason. The Theology of the Body series of Wednesday addresses, *Veritatis Splendor* on the question of the moral life and *Fides et Ratio* on the relation between faith and reason will remain lasting testaments to the Christian response to the human condition and the basic building blocks of a Christian civilisation.

Pope John Paul II possessed a personal understanding of the role of culture in faith formation, something that for good reasons was not really understood at the Second Vatican Council. The Bishops of the Council had been formed in the 1930s and had seen the devastation of two world wars, then the era of 1960s peace, when rising living standards were largely accepted as progress. Perhaps it was the bishops from eastern Europe who were able to see that culture does not just ‘happen’, but was born of a struggle against the opposing forces of secularism and communism, and later of consumerism.

The drama of John Paul’s life, his student days, being a priest and bishop under Communism, came together in his own suffering during his last years. He lived what he wrote in *Salvifici Doloris*, on the nature of human suffering, taking up in himself the suffering of Christ. Because of that, any suggestion of resignation possessed no traction.

Here was the witness to the dignity of life, and not just to its function. Sustaining the culture of life is only possible within the Church: only the Church guards the dignity of the person, and that only in relationship with Jesus Christ and His Blessed Mother, the Virgin Mary.

**Peter Newby**

**PLEASE NOTE that links for the various web addresses given in this issue may be found on the Association’s website at <http://latin-liturgy.org/latin-liturgy-all-journal>**



## ***Sed non Martha... Nec Maria...***

### **A Sequence of St Hugh and the Carthusian Paradox**

There is, in the British Library, a fine Missal dating from the second half of the fourteenth century<sup>1</sup>. It contains the usual Calendar, Ordinary, Propers and other items for the Use of Sarum, the variant of the Roman Rite current in England right up to the Reformation. From various details of feasts and observances, it seems likely that the Missal was used in the diocese of Lincoln, and one of these little details is particularly striking. It takes the form of a Sequence<sup>2</sup> in honour of the great saint and bishop of Lincoln, Hugh of Avalon who was born between 1135 and 1140 and died on 16th November 1200.

Even at first sight, one can see that the text of this Sequence, which begins *Sonet mundaе mentis vota*, has been added, squeezed-in, so to speak, at the end of the main body of the Missal, and written in a different scribal hand. Sadly, there is no musical notation, so we can only speculate as to what melody (if any) was used for it.<sup>3</sup> It was included in his great compendium of Latin hymns and sequences *Analecta*

---

<sup>1</sup> Brit. Mus. MS. Add. 11414; happily, the entire Missal is available to view online at: [http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=add\\_ms\\_11414\\_fs001r](http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=add_ms_11414_fs001r) (The Sequence *Sonet mundaе mentis vota* is on page 308v, to which one can scroll using the drop-down menu on the right of the image.)

<sup>2</sup> The Sequence as a liturgical form is familiar from the great Sequences of Easter (*Victimae Paschali Laudes*) and Pentecost (*Veni Sancte Spiritus*). Others, such as the *Dies Irae*, *Stabat Mater* and *Laetabundus* still exert a powerful influence, despite not being regular parts of the modern liturgy. But in the later Middle Ages, Sequences proliferated to an almost absurd degree, and many local saints had their own Sequences.

<sup>3</sup> Sequences may often have simply been read by the priest at Low Mass by this stage in the Middle Ages; however, the unusual variations in the metre of *Sonet mundaе mentis vota* would suggest that some melody was attached to it. In my original talk, I speculatively used part of the melody of *Adest nobis dies alma*, a Sequence for Confessors from the Sarum Use. See <https://macsphere.mcmaster.ca/bitstream/11375/16149/1/Sequentiarium.pdf> at p. 200

*Hymnica* by the German Jesuit scholar Guido Maria Dreves<sup>4</sup>, but is somewhat eclipsed by another Sequence in honour of St Hugh, *Producens caelite*, an altogether more florid and sophisticated work which may, perhaps, have been composed by the chronicler Gerald of Wales (1146-1223), who wrote one of the two principal accounts of the life of St Hugh.

The other (a rather more sober and historically reliable work) is by the monk Adam of Eynsham (c.1155-1233). It must be admitted that this little Sequence, *Sonet mundaе mentis vota* is a somewhat pedestrian piece, giving a brief account of St Hugh's life and merits, and the fact that it was added in the lower margin of the end of this Sarum Missal indicates a very local devotion.

Here, then, is the text of the Sequence, together with a somewhat rough and ready translation:

Sonent mundaе mentis vota,

Let the wishes of the pure mind sound forth;

Sint per vocem vota nota,  
Sit vox dulcis mens devota,  
in Hugonis laudibus.

Let them be made known by the voice,  
Let the sweet voice and devoted mind  
Rise in the praises of St Hugh.

Hic felici vixit vita  
Cartusiensis cenobita:  
Carnem teritheremita  
cilicinis vestibus.

He, throughout a happy life lived,  
As a monk of Charterhouse,  
A hermit, guarding against the flesh,  
By his clothing of hair shirts.

Probant signa fide digna  
Viri Dei titulos,  
Vitae morum meritorum  
quas patent ad oculos.

Signs worthy of faith proved  
His claims to be a man of God,  
In a life-style full of merit  
They were plain for all to see.

Primo rexit; praesulatum  
Post nactus Lincolniae.  
Gradum scandens dignitatum  
Wythamiensem prioratum

Next, inheriting as prelate  
The see of Lincoln.  
And, ascending the steps of honour  
First he governed, prior of Witham

---

<sup>4</sup> See:

<https://archive.org/details/analectahymnicam40drev/page/208/mode/2up>

Sed non Martha contemplantem  
Nec Maria laborantem

Praepedivit, tot librantem  
labores ecclesiae.

Templi, cleri, plebis jura  
Pastorali rexit cura,  
Probat cujus sepultura

meritorum praemia.

Hujus membra celebrantes  
Gaudeant per saecula  
Qui cum Deo est insignis  
Praesul dignus et cum dignis  
nos ducat ad gaudia. Amen.

But, neither did Martha impede  
His contemplation, nor Mary his  
activity,

So well he balanced both  
In his efforts for the church.

By law of church, clergy and people  
He governed with a shepherd's care  
So that his own entombment would  
prove

Reward for all his merits.

May all the church that celebrate him  
Rejoice throughout all ages  
May he who is enrolled with God  
Conspicuous in worth, lead us into joy  
With all who are worthy. Amen

Despite the matter-of-fact tone adopted by this piece, and its rather conventional, not to say generic format, there is one stanza which repays closer attention. It is, indeed, the portion which forms the title of this article:

Sed non Martha contemplantem  
Nec Maria laborantem

Praepedivit, tot librantem  
labores ecclesiae.

But, neither did Martha impede  
His contemplation, nor Mary his  
activity,

So well he balanced both  
In his efforts for the church.

The evocation of the well-known passage from St Luke's Gospel (Lk 10:38-42), where Jesus visits Martha and Mary and receives a different sort of welcome from each, is frequently encountered in medieval sermons and spiritual writing. Martha, who busies herself with the practicalities of serving Jesus, is taken as symbolic of the active Christian life, and Mary, who simply sits and listens to Him, of the contemplative life.

Almost certainly for our author, as for his contemporaries, this parallel comes from St Augustine, who sets it out in his Sermon 103<sup>5</sup>. But the application of the figure of Martha and Mary to St Hugh of Lincoln shows a finesse beyond the

---

<sup>5</sup> Augustine Sermon 103, 1-2, 6: PL 38, 613, 615

merely conventional. In order to see why this is so, and why it shines a light, not only on his vocation, but on the whole story of the Carthusian Order, especially in England, it is necessary to explore Hugh's life in a little more depth.

Hugh was born at Avalon on the border of Burgundy and Savoy in what is now France, the son of Guillaume, *Seigneur* of Avalon<sup>6</sup>. Following his mother's death when he was eight, Hugh was sent to a boarding school for his education and then, rather remarkably, accompanied his father Guillaume, who retired from the world, to the Augustinian monastery of Villard-Benoît.

At the age of fifteen, Hugh became an Augustinian novice, being ordained deacon at the age of nineteen, and then, in 1159 becoming prior of the nearby monastery at Saint-Maximin while still a deacon. Feeling a vocation to a more rigorous form of religious life, Hugh left the Augustinians and entered the Grande Chartreuse, mother-house of the Carthusian order. Only after several years as a Carthusian monk did Hugh receive priestly ordination.

Clearly then, like so many before and since, Hugh experienced the irresistible call to the life of contemplation, like Mary in Augustine's interpretation of the Gospel story. But, again, like so many before and since, the clamours of the world – of Martha, as it were – came knocking at his door.

Now, it is a striking fact that the beginning and end of the Carthusian life in England were both connected to martyrdom. At the beginning came the martyrdom of Thomas Becket, an act so heinous that it sent shock waves resounding across the whole of Europe. The ripples from these shock waves reached as far as the 16<sup>th</sup> century, so that

---

<sup>6</sup> There is an unlovely but imposing neo-gothic tower in Avalon now, built in the nineteenth century in memory of Hugh.

<https://s3.amazonaws.com/gs-geo-images/90c6140a-4bd8-4a49-a50d-6ef776debcf6.jpg>



one of the most determined of the many acts of conscious desecration ordered by Henry VIII in order to extinguish the memory of Becket and his challenge to the English crown, was the complete destruction of the saint's shrine and relics at Canterbury. Henry was also responsible for the final immolation of the Carthusian order, in the mass-murder of the remaining monks of the London Charterhouse in 1535 and the years that followed.

As part of his penance for the murder of Becket (and instead of going on Crusade, following his first instinct), the earlier Henry, Henry II, decided to establish the first English Carthusian house with monks brought from the Grande Chartreuse. Their monastery, at Witham in Somerset, was not a success, and Henry was compelled to try again within a few years.

This time he asked specifically for Hugh of Avalon, whose reputation had evidently reached him, to be made Prior. With Hugh's energetic leadership, a charter of foundation and endowment for the Witham Charterhouse was formally granted in 1182 and King Henry visited it frequently, in part because his favourite hunting-ground at Selwood Forest lay nearby. Because of his frequent contact with the King, Hugh was able to suggest certain improvements to the situation of the English church, including appointing bishops to the many dioceses that lay vacant.

Consequently, in May 1186, Henry summoned a council of bishops and barons at Eynsham Abbey to discuss the issue; the cathedral chapter of Lincoln was ordered to elect a new bishop and, to his dismay, Hugh himself was elected. He insisted on a second, private election by the canons, so as to be sure they were voting of their own free will, but the result was the same. Martha had, indeed, come knocking at his door, and Hugh was duly ordained bishop of Lincoln on 21 September 1186.

Having had the active life of Martha thrust upon him, Hugh undertook all manner of projects, both material and spiritual, within and outside the diocese of Lincoln. Perhaps his crowning achievement was the reconstruction of the chancel of the cathedral, a glorious piece of early Gothic architecture, which still bears his name: St Hugh's Choir. At the same time, Hugh became one of the leading churchmen of his age, to be ranked alongside Archbishop Stephen Langton and, indeed, Becket himself. His wise and steady counsel – which one cannot help feeling came partly from his years of retreat and contemplation in the Grande Chartreuse – was appreciated by King and nobles alike.

With Hugh's inspiring life before us, let us return to the words of our little Sequence:

Sed non Martha contemplantem  
Nec Maria laborantem

Praepedivit, tot librantem  
labores ecclesiae.

But, neither did Martha impede  
His contemplation, nor Mary his  
activity,

So well he balanced both  
In his efforts for the church.

It is worth refining the translation a little: the words *contemplantem... laborantem... librantem...* are all participles, referring to Hugh himself, contemplating, labouring and balancing out all his activities. And the verb *praepedivit* is an unexpected one. Its literal meaning implies an entangling of the limbs, being tied-down or even shackled – exactly the effect that too busy a life would have on a true contemplative. Neither Mary nor Martha restricted Hugh, though, on account of his extraordinary ability to balance contemplation and action.

What, then, of the end of the Carthusians, crushed by the pitiless machinery of the later Henry's Reformation? Clearly, the 'activity' that burst upon them, the demand that they submit formally to Henry VIII as supreme governor of the Church or face death, was infinitely more terrible than anything that happened to Hugh. And yet, if we read the phrase *labores ecclesiae* from our Sequence not so much as the 'efforts for the church' as the 'labours of the church', we

can see a connection. In their stubborn, yet infinitely gentle resistance to Henry's violence, these later Carthusians understood that their *labores* were the same as the *tantus labor* which is named in another Sequence, the Dies Irae – that labour or work of Christ himself:

Quærens me, sedisti lassus:  
Redemisti Crucem passus:  
Tantus labor non sit cassus.

In seeking me, you sat exhausted:  
You redeemed me, enduring the Cross:  
Let not such labour be in vain.

The *labor* of Christ, the work of our salvation, to which he himself refers in the Last Words recorded in John's Gospel: 'It is accomplished' (Jn 19:30) is also obliquely referenced in the great motto of the Carthusian Order: *Stat Crux dum volvitur orbis* - the cross stands still while the world turns.

For Hugh, as for the Carthusian martyrs of the Reformation, the demands of the Cross were absolute, immovable, even to the extent of having to 'crucify' one's own desire and inclination for the contemplative solitude of the Charterhouse, or, even worse, give up one's life entirely in imitation of Christ's self-sacrifice. This is the strange paradox of Carthusian life: the more absolute is the commitment to contemplation and solitude, the more clamorous and insistent the demands and insults of the outside world become, and it is perhaps the Order's most profound gift and insight to the Church and the world as a whole. It seems to have been something that the modest and anonymous author of the Sequence *Sonet munda mentis vota* both understood and captured in that little reference to Martha and Mary.

Why was St Hugh able to balance the conflicting demands of his life? Because he understood and lived the fact that 'the Cross stands still while the world turns'.

Stat Crux dum volvitur orbis.  
*Sancte Hugo Lincolniensis, ora pro nobis*  
*Sancti martyres Cartusiani, orate pro nobis*

**Ian G. Coleman**

## **The funeral Mass of Pope Emeritus Benedict**

The funeral Mass of Pope Emeritus Benedict was celebrated almost entirely in Latin, more than likely at his own request. The readings were in Spanish, English and Italian, and the bidding prayers in German, French, Arabic, Portuguese and Italian, though ending with *Dominum deprecemur/te rogamus, audi nos* in each case. Otherwise it all seemed rather grudging, and lacking in the sense of importance, and indeed of gratitude, which this momentous farewell should have had.

The present Pope did not have much to say about his illustrious predecessor, and what he did say was distinctly lacking in warmth. Added to which, the Vatican establishment's attitude to the event was conspicuously tepid, considering the immensely valuable life and work – and sanctity – of a pontiff who will certainly be numbered among the greatest of the successors of Peter.

In an endeavour to redress this imbalance, Fr Guy Nicholls offers the following reflection, from a sermon he gave shortly afterwards:

“We cannot pass over the death on the last day of 2022 of the great and dearly loved pastor and pope, Benedict XVI. There will be much to be said of such an extraordinary man in the weeks, months and indeed years to come. A man of his stature does not often come into a supremely important role at such an important time in history as Pope Benedict did.

Furthermore, even though he had been ‘retired’ since 2013, he has been a continuing presence in the Church and the world for nigh on ten years since, not least as one praying at the very heart of the Church, within a few feet of the bones of St Peter. We will not know until we reach heaven, God willing, just how much Pope Benedict's prayers, sufferings and sorrows over the last ten years have averted some even greater catastrophes than those which have befallen the Church in all that time.



Let us pray that his intercession from heaven may soon be of even greater help, though I have to admit that even having him as a saint in heaven will not yet altogether wipe away the sadness of losing his tranquil and wise presence from our midst on earth.”

For more on Pope Benedict we would recommend:

<https://adoremus.org/2023/01/the-liturgical-legacy-of-pope-benedict-xvi/>

### **Doctrina Romanensium de purgatorio**

Such reactions as we have received to the article in *Latin Liturgy* 162 on the book of Common Prayer in Latin suggest that however much disagreement there is about contemporary issues within both the Catholic and Anglican Churches, past religious controversies do not now arouse the interest they once did, except perhaps among academics with a scholarly, but not a religious, interest.

Perhaps this is a good thing. There was one element that did provoke some curiosity, however, and that was the fact of the Articles of Religion, a very strongly protestant text, being put into Latin. But a caveat must be observed here: for most English people from the generation after the protestant reformation to the time of the Oxford Movement there was no automatic connection at all between Latin and Catholicism. Latin, to an English gentleman of those centuries, meant not Catholicism but the law, the classics and indeed learning in general. But for us today, it is strangely ironic to see some of the Articles, such as those which follow, in Latin.

[The capitalisation differs between the Latin and English versions, but there does not seem to be any particular significance in that.]

XIX ...*Sicut erravit ecclesia Hierosolymitiana, Alexandrina, et Antiochena; ita et erravit ecclesia Romana, non solum quoad*

*agenda, et ceremoniarum ritus, verum in his etiam, quae credenda sunt. ‘...As the Church[es] of Jerusalem, Alexandria, and Antioch, have erred; so also the Church of Rome hath erred, not only in their living and manner of ceremonies, but also in matters of Faith.’*

*XXII Doctrina Romanensium de purgatorio, de indulgentiis, de veneratione et adoratione tum imaginum, tum reliquarium, nec non de invocatio sanctorum, res est futilis, inaniter conficta, et nullis Scripturarum testimoniis innititur; imo verbo Dei contradicit. ‘The Romish Doctrine concerning Purgatory, Worshipping and Adoration, as well of Images and of Reliques, and also invocation of Saints, is a fond [i.e. foolish] thing vainly invented, and founded upon no warranty of Scripture, but rather repugnant to the Word of God.’*

*XXVIII ...Panis et vini transubstantiatio in Eucharistia ex sacris literis probari non potest; sed apertis scripturae verbis adversatur, sacramenti naturam evertit, et multarum superstitionum dedit occasionem. ‘Transubstantiation (or the change of the substance of Bread and Wine) in the Supper of the Lord cannot be proved by holy Writ; but it is repugnant to the plain words of scripture, overthroweth the nature of a sacrament, and hath given occasion to many superstitions.’ Corpus Christi datur, accipitur, et manducatur in coena, tantum coelesti et spirituali ratione. Medium autem quo corpus Christi accipitur et manducatur in coena, fides est. ‘The Body of Christ is given, taken and eaten, in the Supper, only after an heavenly and spiritual manner. And the mean whereby the Body of Christ is received and eaten in the Supper is Faith.’*

There are some parts of this book (*Liber Precum Communium... in Ecclesia Anglicana Receptus*) which it is hard to imagine actually being used in practice, even among the most earnest undergraduates reading for the Church in the 18<sup>th</sup> century. Take the Catechism for example, subtitled in the English: ‘An Instruction to be Learned of Every Person, before he be brought to be confirmed by the Bishop’. The

candidate is addressed by the Catechist in English as ‘My good child’, and in Latin as *optime Filii*.

He goes on: ‘know this, that thou art not able to do these things of thyself, not to walk in the Commandments of God and to serve him, without his special grace, for which thou must learn at all times to call for by diligent prayer. Let me hear, therefore, if thou canst say the Lord’s Prayer’. And this is the Lord’s Prayer that our precocious youth, if suitably instructed, would recite:

*Pater noster, qui es in coelis, sancta colatur nomen tuum. Veniat regnum tuum. Fiat voluntas tua, ut in coelo, sic et in terra. Victum nostrum alimentarium da nobis hodie: et remitte nobis debita nostra, ut et nos remittimus debitoribus nostris: neve nos in tentationem inducito, sed a malo tuere. Amen.*

In conclusion, it is worth remarking that today, in any ultra-High Church corner of Anglicanism where you might come across the Eucharist conducted in Latin, it will not be Edward Harwood’s book that you will hear, but almost certainly it will be the *Missale Romanum* – in one form or another!

**Christopher Francis**

### **July 8th 2023: the Bede Lecture, at Ealing Abbey**

Mgr Bruce Harbert, a distinguished member of the Association and a member of its Council, will be giving the Bede lecture at Ealing Abbey on July 8, 2023. His theme will be *Linguae latinae usus ... in Ritibus latinis servetur*. An invitation to attend this lecture has kindly been extended to members of the ALL. For information go to:

<https://liturgyinstitute.org/blog/mgr-bruce-harbert-2023-st-bede-lecture/>

It doesn't appear to be necessary to book a place, but we would advise letting the Institute know if you plan to attend. Members will certainly also be interested in some of the courses offered by the Institute, especially those making up the Latin Summer School:

<https://liturgyinstitute.org/courses/>

## **NOTAE LATINAE**

### **Consultation on Synodality: a response**

Most Catholics' principal contact with the Church is Sunday Mass attendance. In the Synodality Consultation document the liturgy is mentioned under three headings:

38: Listening to those who feel neglected and excluded;

88: Synodal life and liturgy;

91: Managing Tensions

Current tensions over the liturgy are largely of the Church's own making, going back to the tsunami of changes imposed on congregations fifty years ago, as described so thoroughly in *The Two Catholic Churches: A Study in Oppression* (Tony Archer, then OP) published in 1986, right up to the Pope Francis' recent *motu proprio Traditionis Custodes*. These tensions will only ease if the Church re-evaluates changes to the liturgy in the light of what was actually promulgated by Vatican II, and uses the flexibility of the new rite to have it adhere much more closely to the best liturgical principles of the old rite. This should provide a more contemplative form of celebration, with less emphasis on hymn singing, and more on the official chants and texts of the Church, with much more use of Latin – after all it is the Church's international liturgical language, particularly important as people from many parts of the world come to worship in our churches.

**Bernard Marriott** (Holy Cross Parish, Leicester)

## Belgicatho

On December 30<sup>th</sup> last year the Chairman received the following message from Dr Denis Crouan of the French Association *Pro Liturgia*:

Since *Pro Liturgia* has ceased to issue its publications, because of numerous difficulties encountered in all the dioceses of France, the director of the French language website Belgicatho has offered to provide courses in liturgy online, by video. This makes things easier, and we reach far more people than we do with the bulletin *Pro Liturgia*. So the work continues, but in another form.

Given that I have put my various writings into my computer, I now have a history of the Roman liturgy which is pretty well complete, since it goes up to the *Motu proprio Traditionis custodes* of Pope Francis. I am sending it to you, hoping that it will interest you.

We are thinking very much of our good Pope Emeritus Benedict. He is living through a difficult time, and is without doubt preparing to sing the liturgy which is celebrated in the celestial Jerusalem through all eternity.

I wish all the members and friends of the Association for Latin Liturgy an excellent 2023.

(Translation by the Editor.)

The Chairman replied on behalf of the ALL:

I write to reply as news reaches us of the death of our Holy Father Pope Emeritus Benedict. You write very beautifully in your message of his approaching departure from this world: thank you for those words, which are much appreciated by us all.

We are most interested to learn of your work for the website Belgicatho, and will inform our members about it.

<http://www.belgicatho.be/>



With very best wishes from us all for a good and – let us hope – more tranquil New Year in 2023

## ASSOCIATION FOR LATIN LITURGY

Founded in 1969 to encourage and extend the use of Latin in the liturgy of the Catholic Church

Under the patronage of the Bishops' Conference of England & Wales

Chairman	Christopher Francis, 16 Brean Down Avenue, Bristol BS9 4JF
Vice-Chairman	Fr Guy Nicholls Cong Orat
Treasurer	Bernard Marriott
Membership Secretary	Brendan Daintith, 173 Davidson Road, Croydon CR0 6DP <i>Brendan.Daintith@Latin-Liturgy.org</i>
Website	<a href="http://www.Latin-Liturgy.org">www.Latin-Liturgy.org</a>
Facebook	<a href="https://www.facebook.com/latinliturgy">www.facebook.com/latinliturgy</a>

Publications may be ordered and subscriptions renewed at [latin-liturgy.org](http://latin-liturgy.org)

**Latin Liturgy No 163 copyright © 2023 Association for Latin Liturgy, except where otherwise acknowledged.**

**Photos © Jane Krish (inside back cover); the Editor(other photos).  
Reproduction, by whatever means, requires written permission.**



*View of the original Strawberry Hill mansion, now part of St Mary's University*





*Benediction in St Mary's University Chapel*