



LATIN LITURGY

The Journal of the Association for Latin Liturgy
No 150 – St Thomas Aquinas 2017



www.Latin-Liturgy.org

In this issue

Editorial.....	2
The 2106 Annual General Meeting.....	3
Sermon at the AGM Mass	8
Sacra Liturgia Conference 2016.....	10
Recording the <i>Graduale Parvum</i>	16
The Fifth Bede liturgy lecture	17
Chant Forum.....	18
Report on Norwich Chant Day.....	19
JHN: the Power of Octaves	20
Pietas.....	24
Letters to the Editor.....	26
Varia Latina.....	28
John Hoban 1926-2016.....	31
Aquinas translated?	33
Appendix: Accounts 2015-2016	34

Photo credits: front cover (Mass at Buckfast Abbey during 2015 ALL conference): the Editor: back cover (Fr Guy Nicholls presents Cardinal Sarah with prototype copy of the Graduale Parvum): Dom Alcuin Reid

From the Editor

I must apologise for the very late appearance of this issue, due to circumstances beyond editorial control. There will be two further editions this year, with news of future meetings. This is the 150th edition of *Latin Liturgy* (known until 2010 simply as the *Newsletter*). Looking at previous landmark editions, we find in No.1 (November 1969) that our inaugural Mass was sung by the Revd M C Crowdy of the London Oratory at the Servite Priory, London with a choir conducted by Mr Edward de Rivera singing plainsong and polyphony. The following were elected to the Council:

Dr R H Richens (Chairman), Dr Helen Clover, Fr Joseph Crehan SJ, Mr Colin Mawby, Mr Edward de Rivera, Mr Anthony Simons and Mr Michael Trask. The annual subscription was set at ten shillings.

In the 50th edition (1982) it is announced that the Association's Latin-English Missal (the first bilingual Missal since the Council) was about to be published. Elsewhere, the results of the Vatican's survey of parish liturgies (carried out, it has to be said, in a not entirely straightforward manner) were reported. The Editor commented: 'It seems that the bishops were anxious to reassure the Roman authorities on the happy state of their dioceses, and their remarks illustrate this concern, rather than providing any objective estimate of the liturgical situation.'

Finally, from the hundredth edition (1997) which had a colour cover showing an ALL Mass at St Etheldreda's Ely Place, London, we select the following from the report on the Spring meeting that year at St Gregory's, Cheltenham: 'Fr Guy Nicholls, asked to elucidate the vexed matter of liturgical celebrations *versus populum* or *versus Deum*, pointed out that the widespread belief that the former is the earliest practice is a misreading of history. He added that the error seems to have been strengthened by the idea in vogue since the Enlightenment that the liturgy is primarily didactic, whereas the primary element is the transcendent.' In the light of the rumpus following Cardinal Sarah's remarks at *Sacra Liturgia* (q.v.) this could hardly be more topical! Back to the present day, Fr Guy has gone from strength to strength, and I would particularly like to draw your attention to his perceptive and revealing article below on Cardinal Newman. I also commend warmly to you Mgr Harbert's essay on *Pietas*. Both of these articles are making their first appearance here; readers will know how fortunate we are to have scholars of this calibre in our Association.

Report on the 2016 AGM

The Association had an excellent day of liturgies, discussions and socialising at St Mary Moorfields in the City of London, by kind permission of its new Parish Priest, Fr Christopher Vipers. The day began at noon with Solemn Mass of the feast of St Teresa of Avila. The celebrant was Fr William Young (whose splendid sermon on St Teresa is printed later in this edition) assisted by Mgr Bruce Harbert and Br Dominic Edwards. We are grateful to Mgr Harbert for

standing in at the last minute for Dr Stephen Morgan, who had suffered an injury and was unable to come, and to whom we wish a complete recovery. An outstanding feature of the Mass was the singing of the schola directed by Fr Guy Nicholls: its members were Anthony Bevan, Claude Crozet, Frank Leahy and two of his sons, Bernard Marriott and Alastair Tocher, and the organist was Christopher Francis. *Cunctipotens Genitor Deus* was the plainsong Ordinary, and all the chants of the Proper *Dilexisti Iustitiam* were from the Association's major work in progress, the *Graduale Parvum*, which is largely the work of Fr Nicholls. It all worked extremely well, musically and liturgically.

An informal, but leisurely and convivial lunch followed, after which the Chairman spoke on 'Music and the Mass'. The text will be printed in our next issue. The questions and discussion which followed produced divergent views on three related questions: the desirability or otherwise of singing Gregorian chant in English, the extent to which Catholic liturgies in England should or should not resemble those of the Church of England, and the use of Anglican hymns in Catholic worship. Over the years, quite a few members of the Association have been converts from Anglicanism, and that is still the case, and it seemed from some of the points made by members present that the ALL attracted them by its appeal to *gravitas* and consistency of tone in liturgy, as much as by its campaigning for the use of the Latin language *per se*. As for making the use of Latin in the Church more common, it was generally agreed that this would be far more likely to come about through congregations *singing* it rather than speaking it.

The Business Meeting followed, beginning with the Chairman's Annual report: "Unusually, it is rather more than a year since the last Chairman's report, as the 2015 AGM took place in August, at Buckfast Abbey, over two days. That was the first time we have ever attempted a two-day conference, and it was a great success, intellectually, liturgically and socially. In November, four Council members represented the Association at Towards Advent in Westminster Cathedral Hall, and in July this year five members of Council attended the conference *Sacra Liturgia* at Imperial College, London, the liturgies for which mostly took place at the Oratory

nearby. This was an event of some importance, and most notably from our perspective we were able to present Bishop Hopes with a prototype copy, bound by our Treasurer, of the complete Introits for the *Graduale Parvum*, and Fr Guy was also able to bring it personally to the notice of Cardinal Robert Sarah, Prefect of the Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments, who was a key presence and speaker at the conference.

Work on the *Graduale Parvum* is currently our major occupation, and we are very fortunate in, and deeply grateful to, Fr Guy Nicholls and Bernard Marriott for their tireless work on this extremely important project. We are most grateful also to Francis Bevan who by means of computer type-setting is steadily transforming manuscripts into polished printed chants and text. Another important step in the project will occur later this month, when several members and friends of the Association will convene at Buckfast Abbey to make recordings of all the Introits for Sundays and Holydays. It is intended that these will be available for download with the corresponding chant PDF for the benefit of choirs new to chant. All the Introits will be available for purchase in book form.

Representatives of the Association met Fr Paul Gunter, the Secretary of the Bishops' Conference's Department for Christian Life and Worship, in September last year to make an agreement in principle on the translations to be used for the English chants in the *Graduale Parvum*. The translation of psalms will be the Revised Grail version, and we are in the process of assembling these translations in order to obtain the *Nihil obstat*, *Imprimatur* and official recognition by the Bishops' Conference.

Plans for next year's meeting or meetings are in their early stages, and information will appear in good time in *Latin Liturgy*. Communicating with members is something that very much needs to be improved and speeded up, and it is disappointing that fewer than half of members have responded to our request for their email addresses. Their reasons for not doing so are impenetrable, and no doubt varied, but I hope for a growing acceptance of the necessity

for email communication with, and between, members, and for their recognition of the fact that our profile and the cogency of our message can only reach its potential audience by using all the means of electronic communication at our disposal. I once more reiterate that addresses will *not* be divulged to other members or to any third parties.

On the subject of electronic media, I would like to express my personal thanks to Bernard Marriott for his tireless and wholly successful work in bringing our long-dormant website back to life. Without a properly working website our existence would be entirely in the shadows. Bernard has been greatly assisted by the technical expertise of Sui-Leung Chai, a friend of our late and much lamented colleague Jeremy de Satgé, who has generously, for the most modest of fees, restored working function to all parts of the site. Those of you – and I hope that it will eventually be the majority – who follow our excellent Facebook page, will be aware of the sterling work that Graeme Jolly (our excellent MC today) is doing there, to the great benefit of our reputation. In an adjacent field, with good correspondence between the two, Laura Dance's new initiative of the ALL Twitter account should also claim your attention. There are many competing voices in online Catholicism, some of them as strident and unpleasant as their secular counterparts, but the ALL's voice is 'the still small voice of calm' amid all the frenzy.

We now have two diocesan representatives, Paul Henriksen for East Anglia and Frances Hogwood for Plymouth; their work is being co-ordinated by Brendan Daintith. There was an excellent Gregorian Chant day on 17th September in the Cathedral of St John the Baptist, Norwich, which Paul Henriksen promoted and ran jointly with the Cathedral's Director of Music, Daniel Justin. The overall liturgical situation in this country has not been as greatly affected as many thought it would be by the pontificate of Pope Francis but there is no doubt that Latin in the Ordinary Form (we used to call it the 'New Rite', but it seems absurd to continue to do so) is under pressure from the great preponderance of Tridentine Masses, and the ample and well-financed resources of organisations that promote it. All in all, though, despite our chronic scarcity of working personnel, the Association is doing pretty well, and I hope it will

receive more active support from you, the members, to ensure that it continues to do so.”

The Treasurer’s report followed. He presented the accounts for the year ending 5 April 2016 (see Appendix). The surplus for the year amounted to nearly £8,200, but he drew members’ attention to the exceptionally large income from donations. This figure was made up principally of an anonymous donation from a member of £2,000 for the *Graduale Parvum*, and a legacy of £5,000 from Mrs Winifred Litten of Ellesmere Port, who had been a member since 1970 and who died last year. The Association is especially grateful to these members. Work on the *GP* had begun in earnest during the year and we had paid £665 for the engraving of the Introits. The net cost of the two-day meeting at Buckfast Abbey and the Requiem for Edward Barrett came to around £675. Our closing balance was in excess of £18,000, but without the large donations our surplus would have been about £1,200. We are living within our means, but need to keep a close eye on expenditure. The accounts were approved by the meeting. [Note: since the AGM we have spent about £2,000 on recording the *GP* Introits.]

Members then returned to the church for Vespers and Benediction, the music for which was provided by the same director, schola and organist as the Mass. The Vespers hymn was *Deus creator omnium*, with the psalms *Domine clamavi ad te, ad me festina* and *Voce mea ad Dominum clamo* with the NT canticle *Christus Iesus cum in forma Dei esset*. At benediction the *Adoro te devote* was sung, and the liturgy concluded with the *Salve Regina* sung before the statue of Our Lady. This was an excellent day, from which everyone came away enriched.

Nonetheless (*and we address this particularly to members who could have attended but did not*) it must be said that the number who actually came was far fewer than we had expected. Members of Council and many other people put a great deal of work into a really excellent day, but were very disappointed when they saw how few of you had come. The Association, after all, is what its members make it, and if you really wish it to continue and to

flourish, we do urge and encourage you to attend and enjoy our meetings!

Sermon given at the AGM Mass on 15 October 2016

Each year our meetings fall on different liturgical days, providing us with an opportunity to reacquaint ourselves with a particular saint. Many of you know more about St Teresa of Jesus, of Avila, than I, so I limit myself to a reflection on how her example in fulfilling her mission might encourage us in fulfilling ours.

St Teresa lived at a time when Spain, in the aftermath of the Reconquest, was undergoing rapid economic and sociological change, driven by the influx of new wealth from the New World. There were wars in Europe. There was reaction to the horrors of the Reformation in the North. Everywhere there was the desire to control religion and its expression. Once Teresa had overcome the resistance to change within herself, she became an impassioned reformer of her order. She faced determined opposition, but was more than equally determined herself. If we can look back on sixteenth century Spain and see a blessed time when the Catholic faith and the civilisation it nourished truly blossomed, then this is in no small part due to the work and influence of St Teresa. Bringing about change is always difficult. Her struggle to reinvigorate religious life in the teeth of ignorance, opposition and sloth brought constant frustrations. We can laugh at her quip that if God treats his friends so badly, as she complained he treated her, then it can be no surprise that he had so few of them. We can laugh, but only a saint could dare speak to God like that.

What can she teach us in the context of our annual Association Mass today? We too are living through a time of great change, with its sporadic joys and inevitable frustrations. Teresa's mission was to enable her sisters and brothers in religion to become more serious about the religious life. With the help of others, saints like her among them, she succeeded. She stuck to her conviction that she herself and others needed to change. The lesson for us is to hold fast to our conviction that the use of Latin in the worship of God is a

precious treasure that must not be abandoned. Our mission (can I call it that?) is to demonstrate, by witnessing to it, the importance of Latin liturgy and of all that its preservation maintains and supports artistically, culturally, and in other ways.

The Church's worship is for the entire People of God. It is right to invest energies and resources in using the treasures of the Latin liturgical tradition in our cathedrals, abbeys, parishes, chaplaincies, and elsewhere, in whatever way enables them to nourish new generations who desire to worship God worthily, and who are open to being taught how to do it. Latin is not an obstacle. On the streets of Barking, and not just there, English is far from being the only, or even predominant language spoken these days. We cannot hope to celebrate Mass in all the scores of vernaculars our people use in a world that is being transformed at an ever increasing pace. In fact, I make this assertion: Mass ought never to be celebrated in a vernacular at all, if vernacular means the language of the street! The use of Latin in Mass gives an example of how other languages can achieve the stability and classicity necessary for their use in the solemn public worship of God. It is said that learning a new language means gaining a new soul. If so, this can give the People of God a 'new soul'. We must not fear or oppose the development of new liturgical languages. But nor do we abandon the language that 1800 years of Christian public worship in Europe and the West has used. It is not a historic monument to be admired. It is a resource. It works both ways: the use of Latin in worship will enable 'vernacular people' to find a 'new soul' themselves when they are given the chance to use the Latin of the Mass as well as their mother tongue. Latin has a part to play in saving the Liturgy, so that the Liturgy can save the world.

I have strayed from our saint. Today we honour St Teresa at Mass. We use the Language of the Church, ever ancient and ever new, to focus our hearts and minds on God and to carry our voices in praise of him. We are using today the rediscovered and rejuvenated resources of the tradition – the *Graduale Parvum* – to enhance the offering of our prayer. May the Lord accept our prayers, bless our work, and cheer our hearts. St Teresa, pray for us.

Fr William Young

Sacra Liturgia Conference, London 2016

Five members of the ALL Council participated in the 2016 Sacra Liturgia conference from 5 to 8 July. The conference sessions took place in a lecture theatre at Imperial College, and all but one of the liturgies in the London Oratory Church, opening with Solemn Vespers on Tuesday, sung according to the *Breviarum Romanum* of 1961. The celebrant was Bishop Dominique Rey, Bishop of Fréjus-Toulon, and the music was sung by the Choir of the Oratory directed by Patrick Russill. In this and in all the other liturgies the music was superb, and immeasurably heightened and enhanced all four days of the event.

We then moved on, down Exhibition Road to Imperial College, for the first session of the conference itself. Following Opening Reflections by Bishop Dominique Rey, the conference was addressed by Cardinal Robert Sarah, Prefect of the Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments. This was a long and discursive speech, but one thing in it, towards the end, caused a sensation. This was the passage in which the Cardinal advocated widespread celebration (of the present, post-conciliar rite) *ad orientem*, from the first Sunday of Advent. It was only one of many things he said, but it provoked a convulsion in the Catholic media for weeks. Afterwards, the Schola Cantorum of the London Oratory School, under the direction of Charles Cole, gave an excellent concert in the beautiful Anglican church of Holy Trinity, Prince Consort Road, in which the principal work was Tye's *Missa Euge Bone*. It was also very interesting to hear the unusual and beautiful *Nunc Dimittis* written by Gustav Holst for Sir Richard Terry in 1915, and first performed in Westminster Cathedral on Easter Sunday that year.

As to the conference in general, here are the impressions of two members of Council who were there, firstly from Bernard Marriott: "This action-packed four-day conference had drawn together a couple of hundred delegates from all over the world, a majority of them with English as their first language. Probably about one-third of the delegates were priests or religious. The days were divided between lectures and liturgy. For me, it was the liturgies which held the greater interest overall, and they covered, on successive

evenings, old rite Vespers, new rite Solemn Mass, old rite Pontifical Mass, and Ordinariate Rite Solemn Mass. The first three services were held at the London Oratory, and the last at the Church of Our Lady of the Assumption and St Gregory, Warwick Street, the Ordinariate church. All were celebrated with the greatest care and attention to detail, so that the serving did not distract us with things going wrong, never leaving us wondering how the servers would extricate themselves from a muddle. This was all the more remarkable as the ceremonies were one-off events, performed by teams of ministers and servers many of whom must have been on unfamiliar territory, working with people they didn't know. In all cases the music was excellently chosen and superbly executed, in the Oratory either by the Oratory choir itself or the Schola Cantorum of the Oratory school. The office of Vespers was celebrated by Bishop Dominique Rey of Fréjus-Toulon who stayed all week, and who was later to say that he will write to his priests recommending them to start celebrating Mass *ad orientem* as suggested by Cardinal Sarah. The following day's solemn Mass was celebrated by Cardinal Sarah, in a clear demonstration of the majesty of which the new rite is perfectly capable. His Eminence was supported by two deacons and an Assistant Priest, and the customs were observed of using the *gremiale*, having the *Canon Episcopalis* (the book containing the common of the Mass from the Offertory to the end, and other prayers and forms used by bishops), and having a hand-candle lit when the Cardinal was reading from a book. The Lectionary items were read or sung in English but otherwise the Mass was entirely in Latin. Few solemn Masses celebrated by bishops these days, and fewer still by cardinals, have such a sensible balance between Latin and the vernacular.

Pontifical old rite Mass the next day was celebrated at the faldstool by Archbishop Salvatore Cordileone, Archbishop of San Francisco, who also stayed all week. It was a different affair from the previous evening, much more complex in its ceremonial, and with special touches such as the triple-candle torches – where else could a church produce six of these? The *pièce de résistance* was the use of a cushion in the last moments of the Mass, neatly slid under the Archbishop's knee just as he genuflected at *et verbum caro factum est*, and then swiftly removed. Adrian Fortescue's *Ceremonies of*

the Roman Rite Described provides twenty pages of description of Pontifical High Mass at the Throne, and a further ten pages on Pontifical Mass at the Faldstool. These pages clearly illuminated the arrangements for Cardinal Sarah's new rite Mass, and were followed in great detail at Archbishop Cordileone's old rite Mass. A powerful demonstration of the hermeneutic of continuity.

The last of the liturgies was the Solemn Ordinariate Mass, celebrated by Mgr Keith Newton, the Ordinary, with an Assistant Priest. The rite, dignified and worthy, contains various elements of the old Roman rite such as the prayers at the foot of the altar and the Last Gospel. The use of the older form of the second person singular added a measure of solemnity. Mass began and concluded with a hymn, and the *Te Deum* was sung immediately after Communion. The entire service was in the vernacular, but in my view some use of Latin would have made a stronger statement of the Ordinariate rite's place in the liturgy of the universal Church.

The highlight of the conference itself came right at the beginning, with Cardinal Sarah's address. He spoke at length about *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, explaining what the intentions of the Fathers of Vatican II were, and describing how they were carried out (or rather *not* carried out). All this painted a picture with which we are all too familiar. What was most important was to learn what the Congregation for Divine Worship is doing about the current state of affairs. There are three prongs to the attack: first, to see that candidates for the diaconate and priesthood are given a full grounding in the richness of the liturgy, including the old rite; second, being clear about the real meaning of *participatio actiosa* (i.e. interior participation which may be manifested by exterior activity); and third, to consider what would be appropriate for a reform of the reformed rites. Indeed, Pope Francis has asked Cardinal Sarah to study this last question, including how to enrich both forms of the Roman rite, always considering the hermeneutic of continuity. Cardinal Sarah ended with his now well-known recommendation (see below) that priests celebrate *ad orientem*, implementing this with catechesis and with prudence. They should aim to start on the First Sunday of Advent. This proclamation brought prolonged applause, and the Cardinal asked us all to pray

for him. He attended the conference the next day, and Fr Guy Nicholls was able to show him a prototype copy of our *Graduale Parvum*, containing the chants for all the Introits of the Sundays and Feasts of the Year.

Later in the week, Bishop Hopes spoke on the forthcoming revised translation of the Liturgy of the Hours, after which Fr Guy presented him with the prototype copy of the *Graduale Parvum*, gratefully and cordially received by his Lordship. One of the principal benefits of the conference was the opportunity to meet like-minded folk from other countries, and here special mention must be made of three Americans, William Mahrt and Jennifer Donelson, respectively President and a Director of the Church Music Association of America (CMAA), and Adam Bartlett, producer of the *Lumen Christi Missal* with its accompanying Gradual and Hymnal. Jennifer Donelson gave a paper on 'Origin and effects of the *Missa Lecta*: Priestly Musical Formation in a Low Mass Culture'. The CMAA website has a wealth of useful information and material which can be downloaded, and is highly to be recommended. Next year's conference will be held in Milan from 6 to 9 June and will, I hope, provide an opportunity to gain some experience of the Ambrosian Rite."

Next from Mgr Bruce Harbert: "I approached the *Sacra Liturgia* conference with a degree of apprehension. Posters advertising the conference and its predecessors had focused on spectacular solemn celebrations of the liturgy. Of course, clergymen look more interesting when beautifully vested than when lecturing in plain clothes, but would the entire conference be unduly preoccupied with the externals of liturgical performance? I need not have worried. The organisers were two fine and productive liturgical scholars, Fr Uwe Lang and Dom Alcuin Reid. They had gathered scholars from throughout Europe to explore and illuminate the Church's worship from many different angles. Cardinal Sarah's opening address set the tone. His recommendation that the celebrant at Mass return to an eastward position was widely reported and provoked some controversy. But it was only one paragraph in a meditative exploration of the liturgy's spiritual dimension, of the liturgy as prayer.

From a rich diet, my attention was particularly caught by Professor Peter Stephan's account of various attempts to re-order the Cathedral of Saint Hedwig in Berlin. He showed us pictures of many different arrangements, most of which, to me at least, echoed schemes familiar from elsewhere. The most dramatic involved digging a huge hole in the middle of the nave. Unsurprisingly, few of the architects consulted seem to have considered the building's natural orientation, decided from its beginning by King Frederick II, along the East-West axis. Another German, Professor Helmut Hoping, spoke on 'Liturgy and the Triune God'. I was fascinated by this, perhaps because I have taught Trinitarian Theology myself, but the discussion that followed showed up the difficulty of discussing theological subtleties among native speakers of different languages. I think I failed to explain to the lecturer the difference between saying 'one God' and 'the one God', which is important for the translation of the conclusion to the Collects. We still need Latin to preserve our theological heritage.

From the United Kingdom, Bishop Alan Hopes, a member of ICEL, offered an exposition of the principles being followed in a new translation of the Liturgy of the Hours. This gave me an opportunity to ask whether the process would involve the *Vox Clara* Committee, which has so grossly disfigured the official English translation of the Missal. He assured us that a new day had dawned, that all parties to the process were in closer agreement, and that this promised us an accurate and elegant English Breviary. We shall see. The proceedings of the Conference will eventually be published in the form of a book, which I recommend as a serious study of the liturgy from many angles. And the next *Sacra Liturgia* conference will take place on 6 – 9 June 2017 in Milan, a city of particular liturgical interest since it has its own ancient Ambrosian liturgical forms. Well worth attending, I should say."

And your Editor's attention was particularly caught by Alcuin Reid's lecture on 'The Council Fathers' Debate of the Schema on the Sacred Liturgy', the 1962-63 debate that gave rise to *Sacrosanctum Concilium*. Was it to be pastoral evolution or *revolution*? There is no evidence that any of the bishops arrived *expecting* a revolution. Was Paul VI a part of the problem? And here in England, Cardinal

Heenan didn't want the changes, but for him it was a question of 'obedience'.

Now here is a brief selection from what was printed in the media after Cardinal Sarah's speech was first reported. 'A liturgical earthquake' said the *Catholic Herald* of 15 July. 'The Cardinal said that the Second Vatican Council did not require the priest to celebrate Mass facing the people...this was a possibility, not an obligation...from the offertory onwards it is essential that the priest and faithful look together towards the east. This corresponds exactly to what the Council Fathers wanted.' But later in the same edition there was a photograph of a stern-faced Cardinal Nichols, over the caption: 'Cardinal Nichols said Mass was not the time for clergy 'to exercise personal preference or taste'. [Although many Mass-goers might be thinking that's what some of them have been doing for years]. Christopher Howse in *The Daily Telegraph* of 9 July recounted how he had met Cardinal Sarah in the street afterwards, and asked him if was true that he wanted this literal orientation, *ad orientem*. 'It is a hope', he said.

The Tablet, meanwhile, with its miserable predictability, was enraged. The front cover read: 'Cardinal Sarah says the priest at Mass should face east like the people. A liturgist explains...why he shouldn't'. Liturgist one, Cardinal nil, obviously. The fatuous leading article 'Which way does God face?' was about as impressive as its title. The Tablet could not conceal its delight when, a little later, the cardinal was, apparently, rebuked by the Pope, who had (according to a Vatican spokesman) met Cardinal Sarah 'to specify that *no* liturgical directives will begin in Advent'. Subsequently *The Tablet* of 5 November reported: 'The appointment of Archbishop Marini [to the CDW] has been seen as a rebuff to Cardinal Sarah, who recently urged priests to celebrate Mass *ad orientem*, before the initiative was slapped down [sic] by Pope Francis.' There was a great deal more of the same. The saddest thing is the lack of charity (most of it from the *ad occidentem* side of the altar) and particularly distasteful in its *ad hominem* attacks on the Cardinal. And if we thought we were living under a pontificate which was sympathetic, or at least indifferent, to our concerns, Pope Francis was quoted in the *Catholic Herald* of 18 November thus: 'to speak of the "reform of

the reform” is an error’. If reported accurately (and there’s no guarantee of that these days) this is, to say the least, somewhat discouraging.

Recording the Introits of the Graduale Parvum

Fr Guy Nicholls arranged for the recording of all the Introits of the year, in Latin and English, for use on the Institute of Liturgical Music’s website. The recordings were made in October in the Blessed Sacrament Chapel at Buckfast Abbey by kind permission of the Abbot. Five of us descended on the Abbey and were met by Philip Arkwright, the Organist and Master of the Music. The singers (Fr Guy himself, Philip Arkwright, Tony Bevan and I) were accompanied on the organ by Joseph Cullen, and the recordings were made by Dave Kitto of Clifton Bank Studios, a friend of the Birmingham Oratory and its liturgical traditions. The Blessed Sacrament Chapel has a very supportive acoustic, and is off the route taken by visitors to the Abbey. Recordings were made, in Latin and English, for all the Sundays and Holydays of the year, plus those feasts which may occur on a Sunday, giving a total of around 150 chants, and the work was accomplished in two days. The principal hazards we encountered were a short loss of power during major works on the power supply, and the occasional screeching seagull! We were accommodated in Northgate House which, it will be recalled by members who attended the 2105 AGM, provides first class facilities.

Considerable work remains to be done to edit the recordings, and the plan is to have the chants and recordings available for download, Sunday by Sunday. Agreement is being sought from the copyright holders of the English texts, and it may be necessary to wait for this before material in English appears. For current information, see jhnilm.org.uk. We are working towards having a book of Introits available through an on-demand print service so that choirs can equip themselves properly. Fr Guy is currently working on the Communions, and the entire year’s Communion verses should be available by the end of 2017.

Bernard Marriott

The Fifth Bede Liturgy Lecture

The title was 'On interiorizing the Mystery of the Eucharist: a reflection on *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, 48', the speaker Professor Joris Geldhof. The title of the talk did not suggest that it was going to be easy listening, and nor was it. Professor Geldhof looked in detail at section 48 (and to a lesser extent section 47). We had both the English translation and the Latin original before us which was useful. Section 48 is concerned with the laity understanding and being involved in what happens at Mass. This noble aim has, of course, not quite worked out as intended. Whatever may be said of participation, there is today very little understanding of the Mystery of the Eucharist. This is at least partly because there is little catechesis on the Eucharist as compared with the other sacraments. We looked at verses from St Thomas' *Pange lingua*, *Lauda Sion* and *Adoro te devote* (again in Latin and English) which provide much material to help in that understanding. (How clear and approachable St Thomas is compared to many modern theologians!)

Professor Geldhof's approach was more a theological discussion of the problem than a practical attempt to find solutions, or so it seemed to me. The questions were interesting, and one monk raised the question of silence, an important and practical point. I asked about the word 'interiorizing,' a word which I am still not sure that I understand, and a lady asked from the back of the room about divorced people being unable to participate and, without taking much notice of what Professor Geldhof said in reply, went on to ask about Cardinal Sarah's encouragement of celebration *ad orientem*. His answer to this was considered and discursive: he was broadly in favour but disliked the way it could divide people into pro- and anti- camps, and this was really his approach to the whole of his topic. Afterwards I was able to talk to Frs Leachman and Carr. The Institutum Liturgicum is clearly a noble enterprise and one to which we should ally ourselves, and help to promote. Incidentally, I later discovered that the lady questioner was Catherine Pepinster, the Editor of *The Tablet* [who announced, in the edition of 17 December, that she was stepping down as Editor].

Brendan Daintith

Chant Forum: summer meeting 2017

‘Please mark in your diaries, and stand by for another meeting of the Monastic Chant Forum at Quarr Abbey, Isle of Wight, in July 2017, from the early evening of Monday 17 to the morning of Friday 21’, writes Dom Benedict Hardy OSB, Prior & Novice Master at Pluscarden Abbey. ‘This will be our third consecutive meeting at Quarr Abbey. The venue is truly excellent for its community, location and environs, and because St. Cecilia’s Abbey, Ryde is so near. Since better speakers than we have had on the previous two occasions can scarcely be imagined, we propose that very same team will again present our programme of lectures and practices. They are Dr Giedrius Gapsys of the Ecole de Chant Grégorien de Paris, Dom Xavier Perrin, Abbot of Quarr, and Sr Bernadette Byrne, Choir Mistress at Ryde.

The theme chosen by Giedrius for us this time is Gregorian phrase analysis and practice. He writes: ‘This is one of the most crucial points in Gregorian studies, and still a very practical one! Text, melody, neumes and mode are the ‘four points of the compass’ that enable us to find our way safely through the Gregorian phrase, and in this way to bring our chant to life’. As before, we hope to attract as many from the monastic world as possible. The presence of monks and nuns from a variety of different communities will be deeply appreciated. But others also will be warmly welcomed, and offered accommodation as space allows.

Anyone attending this meeting will come away with a much enhanced understanding of Gregorian Chant, and an ever deeper appreciation of its value as great music, as sung liturgical worship, as prayer. They will also have experienced a thoroughly enjoyable few days, in a most fraternal and congenial setting. There will be a modest residential fee of £150, or £30 for single days, payable to Quarr Abbey, c/o the Procurator, Fr. Brian Kelly. We will hope to secure a grant to cover the course costs, as usual, but cannot yet promise success in this. If you are ready to book your place now, I’d be very happy to hear from you now. Otherwise, as soon as possible, please!’ Address: Pluscarden Abbey, Elgin, Moray, IV30 8UA. Tel:01343 890 257.

For accommodation at Quarr, please contact Fr. Brian:
procurator@quarr.org
Information about St. Cecilia's Abbey, Ryde from:
Sr. Bernadette Byrne: abbey@stceciliiasabbey.org.uk

Norwich Chant day

A Gregorian Chant Day on 17 September 2016 was jointly run by the ALL and the Diocese of East Anglia. The programme answered the questions 'why Latin?' and 'why the chant?' I produced a booklet of extracts from encyclicals, instructions and exhortations, giving answers and guidance from popes, Vatican II and the Bishops of England and Wales, taking in matters such as reverence, plainchant, Latin and the importance of high standards. The first session included practical work on choirs, vocal production, and how organists should accompany chant. This was followed by learning useful chants, mainly for the Advent/Christmas and Easter Seasons. In the afternoon, following a rehearsal, Mass of Our Lady was celebrated in the Latin Ordinary Form of the Roman Rite, using the *Missae Alma Pater* and *Cum Jubilo* Ordinaries and Propers from the *Graduale Romanum* and *Graduale Parvum*.

Thirty-four people attended, coming from the Cathedral, Norwich churches, Sheringham, Cromer, North Walsham, Ipswich, Peterborough and Cambridge. All received a booklet of useful chants they could introduce in their Parish, the booklet I'd prepared on plainchant and Latin, information about joining the ALL and recent editions of Latin Liturgy, and the sung Mass music booklet. Initial response and feedback was very positive, and I offer to visit any Parish and give tailor-made support to enable them to develop their Latin/plainchant singing. There was an immediate request for another such day for the Diocese, possibly at the Newmarket Church Hall centre which is on a good road network and fairly central in the western half of the Diocese, but still easily accessible for those from Norwich.

Paul Henriksen

The Power of Octaves:

An Argument from Blessed Cardinal Newman

Blessed John Henry Newman is hardly ever noticed as a liturgist. Yet it is a great mistake to ignore the vital place that the liturgy held in his life, not simply as a duty required of any pastor, but as a major source of his religious devotion and understanding. In the *Grammar of Assent*, Newman explored the variety of ways in which the human person is able to know, or apprehend, the revealed truths of faith. He illustrates his famous distinction between 'notional' and 'real' assent particularly by the effect of liturgy and devotion on the believer and worshipper. Even the revealed truths of the faith that are mysteries, which surpass the power of our minds to comprehend them, can, according to Newman, be apprehended more effectively, more 'really', by the effect of participation in liturgical prayer and by a personal devotion exercised in union with the objective structures of the liturgy.

As a young Anglican, Newman's attitude to the liturgy of the Church of England grew in intensity from the time he entered Trinity College, Oxford. Since in those days the Universities were still confessionally Anglican institutions, chapel attendance was compulsory for all members of the colleges. However, Newman was shocked to discover how many of his contemporaries took their religious duties lightly. In fact, he was scandalised at the disrespect shown in a merely formal partaking of holy communion on college feast days, when many undergraduates were still inebriated from the previous evening's college feasts, or 'gaudies'. Even before his Anglican ordination he had called for a less 'formal and heartless' celebration of the chapel services, so as to overcome human 'indifference and coldness'. It was his aim to improve the quality of participation in services which he described as being in themselves 'excellent', by fostering a positive appreciation of the given forms of liturgical worship among his fellow collegians. He himself was already deeply imbued with a sense of the 'most awful of the Christian mysteries, the communion of the body and blood of Christ.'

Newman had always been possessed by a lively sense of God's reality at least from the time of his first, youthful conversion which he described in the *Apologia* as coming to 'rest in the thought of two and two only absolute and luminously self-evident beings', himself and his Creator. Yet he seems to have experienced a further deepening of his sense of the divine presence principally through the growing intensity of his devotional life in the liturgy. Newman developed an ever more profound appreciation of the presence of God, first through the frequent celebration of the Communion service, and also through the constant repetition of the sacred texts of the offices of the liturgical books.

When he first came to preach about the liturgy as a young clergyman, he treated it principally as a tool of instruction, starting from the premiss that the primary purpose of the liturgy was to teach doctrine and form the character, rather than to furnish a source of devotional strength and apprehension of religious truth. But this was to change. Many years later, as a Catholic he reflected on the great love which he had had for the Athanasian Creed since his earliest years as an Anglican. He had even written a 'reflection or sermonet' on it in 1819, when he was only 18 years old, which, though he destroyed it in later years along with much of his juvenilia, must have contained in embryo some of his mature thoughts on the subject. Fifty years later, in the *Grammar of Assent*, he wrote that he had 'ever felt it as the most simple and sublime, the most devotional formulary to which Christianity has given birth', and described it as being not so much a creed as 'a psalm or hymn of praise, of confession, and of profound, self-prostrating homage', and most significantly as 'addressed far more to the imagination and affections than to the intellect.' The way in which it had impressed itself upon Newman was through weekly repetition in the liturgy, both in the Anglican and Catholic prayer books of his day. Newman would surely have been most distressed to see the disappearance from both liturgies in the 20th century of this text which had so profoundly affected him, and had clearly strengthened his own apprehension of the mysteries of the Trinity and the Incarnation which are celebrated in it.

Newman's devotion to the Roman Breviary, which dated from his Anglican days, was in large measure due to his experience that 'it rouses the imagination towards the course of the Christian year.' It is through the power of the imagination that religious ideas, although wholeheartedly believed in, become ever more 'real'. The constant repetition of the psalms and prayers of the Office constitutes a 'dwelling upon' God's attributes, thus transforming them from a mere formal, cold acceptance to a warm and lively apprehension. This is how he understands the transition from notional to real assent in the apprehension of doctrinal truths to take place. He says that 'the exercise of the affections strengthens our apprehension' of the truths of the faith' and 'it is impossible to exaggerate the influence exerted on the religious imagination by a book of devotions so sublime, so penetrating, so full of deep instruction as the Psalter.'

Newman believed that simple statements of faith in human language can nevertheless leave the heart unmoved, no matter how unconditionally they may be believed. The statement that 'there is a God', for instance, 'when held merely as a notion ... requires but a cold and ineffective acceptance, though it be held ever so unconditionally', but when really apprehended, 'is the object of a strong energetic adhesion, which works as a revolution in the mind.' Newman identified 'two great store-houses of faith and devotion' which he found capable of inflaming the imagination and warming the heart to a real assent to what the mind accepted as true, namely 'Scripture and the Ritual of the Church'. He illustrates the potency of Scripture by the examples of the 'power over our affections and emotions' of the opening verses of St John's Gospel, first Epistle and Apocalypse. Referring to the affective power of the Church's liturgy, he draws our attention to the 'services for Christmas or Epiphany; for Easter, Ascension, and...Corpus Christi; what are these great Festivals but comments on the words, "The Son is God"?' Newman here implies that, taken by itself, the statement that 'the Son is God' might exemplify 'the aridity, the coldness of mere scholastic science.' But those feasts, and the texts and rituals with which they are celebrated in the liturgical books, are rather 'addressed ... to the imagination' and thereby designed to 'excite our devotion.'

A particularly effective example of the affective power of the liturgy is to be found, according to Newman in the *Grammar of Assent*, in the case of the 'Divinity of the Holy Ghost.' It is more difficult to rouse an emotional response to the person and role of the Holy Spirit simply as they are revealed to us in Scripture, and conveyed as they are in the seemingly impersonal images of a dove and tongues of fire. But Newman invites us to 'consider the breviary offices for Pentecost and its Octave', which he even suggests are 'the grandest, perhaps, in the whole year'. This is Newman's strongest argument, and best illustration for acknowledging the affective power of a feast to inflame the imagination yet more powerfully through an Octave, which not merely prolongs the celebration, but allows for the expansion and development of its principal ideas.

In the *Development of Christian Doctrine*, Newman drew attention to the power of the *Veni Creator* and the *Veni Sancte Spiritus* to inflame the heart, describing the 'indescribably majestic, solemn and soothing' effect of the words *Altissimi donum Dei, Fons vivus, ignis, caritas*, an effect which he had first noted in his journal on the day of his Anglican ordination. It was the singing of that hymn, albeit in English, but to a version of the familiar Gregorian melody, which had uplifted his spirits where until that moment he had only felt fear and foreboding. Newman suggests in the *Grammar of Assent*, in the full maturity of his Catholic years, that the power of these meditations lies in their evocation of the personhood of the Spirit in his dispensation of grace in the Church, and its consequent impression upon the imagination.

Newman suggests that it was the grandeur of the liturgical celebration of Pentecost prolonged in its Octave, which generated the power to impress and arouse the imagination that created a momentum such as 'to give birth to the noble hymns *Veni Creator*, and *Veni Sancte Spiritus*.' Therefore, according to Newman, the Feast and its Octave together provided the necessary stimulus to realise imaginatively what was being celebrated in them, thereby lending even greater solemnity and impressive power to the mystery embodied therein. It is the character and effect of octaves generally to give greater weight to their Feasts, and the opportunity

for the texts and rituals which embody their message to penetrate so much more profoundly the hearts and imagination of the Church's faithful, both corporately and individually. This is clearly the case with the Octaves of Easter and Christmas which as common celebrations throughout the Church so much more powerfully influence the character and imaginative force of those celebrations of Christ as the Incarnate Son of God and Redeemer.

It must surely be a matter of regret to us, as I suggest it would have been to Newman, that Pentecost is now shorn of the power of so 'grand' an instrument to 'warm the imagination' and 'inflame the hearts' of the faithful, whereby the apprehension of the personal nature and continuing mission of the Holy Spirit as the 'soul' of the Church could be further strengthened in the hearts and minds of the faithful and in the Church's liturgical life.

The Revd Dr Guy Nicholls Cong. Orat.

Pietas

During the rite of Confirmation we pray that the candidates may receive the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, including *pietas* and *timor Domini*. In the new official English translation of the Rite of Confirmation, which came into use at Easter this year, these are translated as 'piety' and 'fear of the Lord'. The earlier version had 'reverence' and 'the spirit of wonder and awe in your presence'. The new version is taken from the official translation of the Catechism of the Catholic Church, as is required by the Instruction *Liturgiam authenticam*, which regulates liturgical translation. In this article I wish to question the appropriateness of this new version. The traditional list of the gifts of the Holy Spirit is based on Isaiah 11.2, which the Revised Standard Version translates thus:

'The spirit of the Lord shall rest on him,
the spirit of wisdom and understanding,
the spirit of counsel and might,
the spirit of knowledge and the fear of the Lord'.

It will be noticed that only six gifts are enumerated here. The following verse begins: 'His delight shall be the fear of the Lord'.

Ronald Knox, in a footnote to his translation of this passage, remarks 'The Hebrew text does not make any mention of the gift of piety; perhaps through a corruption, it seems to introduce "fear of the Lord" twice over'. Knox's own translation, based on the Old Vulgate, reads: '...a spirit of knowledge and of piety, and ever fear of the Lord shall fill his heart'.

When we speak of a person's 'piety', we envisage a disposition towards religious activity. She exhibits her piety by spending a long time in church or at her prie-dieu. The 'piety stall' at the back of my church is intended to support such activity and provide what is required for its exercise - rosaries, prayer-books, holy pictures and so on. But in ancient times, that was not what *pietas* meant. The classic example is Aeneas, whom Vergil repeatedly calls *pious Aeneas* because he rescued his father from the flames of Troy by carrying him on his shoulders. *Pietas* meant loyalty, whether to one's family or to a god. The image of a 'Pelican in her piety' is so called because the mother bird is giving her own blood to feed her chicks, putting us in mind of these lines from the *Adoro te*:

*Pie Pellicane, Jesu Domine,
Me immundum munda tuo sanguine.*

That may also be why a statue of the Blessed Virgin with her dead Son on her knees (for example, the well-known one by Michelangelo) is called a *Pietà* - Our Lady is showing her love for her Son. When, in a well-known prayer for the dead, we mention our 'pious supplications' we mean that we are fulfilling our duty to those whom we have loved. By religious piety we show our love for the God who loves us, not only when we undertake devotional activities, but in the many ways that Christ has taught us.

And what of 'the fear of the Lord'? Although Scripture asserts repeatedly that 'the fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom' (e.g. Ps 110 (111) 10), people are reluctant to speak of it, fearing that such talk makes God appear remote and forbidding.

For instance, although the Collect for the twelfth Sunday Per Annum begins *Sancti nominis tui, Domine, timorem pariter ac*

amorem fac nos habere perpetuum (literally 'Make us, Lord, perpetually to have both fear and love of your holy name') becomes 'Grant, O Lord, that we may always revere and love your holy name'. This loses the oxymoronic contrast between fear and love. They should read Saint Thomas Aquinas. He distinguishes between servile fear, found in a slave's relationship with his master, and filial fear, found in the sentiments of a son towards his father. The slave is afraid that he will be punished, the son knows that he is loved, and responds with respect. The fear of the Lord for which we pray is filial, not servile. Perhaps the Hebrew text is correct in its repetition of 'fear of the Lord', and the Vulgate is correct in using two different words - *pietas* and *timor* - which express, as it were, two facets of a right relationship with God. We might translate them as 'loyal love for God as Father' and 'respectful love for God as Lord'. These subtleties are very difficult, perhaps impossible, to convey in an English suitable for liturgical use. In order to keep western theological and spiritual traditions alive, we still need a Latin liturgy.

Mgr Bruce Harbert

Letters to the Editor

We are delighted to print these two letters received this summer from ALL member Anthony McClaran, now living and working in Australia:

(i)

On a recent Devon holiday my wife and I attended the Sunday morning Conventual Mass at Buckfast Abbey. The Abbey Choir was on good form and the sung parts of the Mass were in Latin. The excellent service booklet contained a redacted version of an address given by the Bishop of Plymouth, the Rt Rev Mark O'Toole, to the 2015 gathering of the Conference of Catholic Directors of Music. There were some points of key interest to the purpose of the ALL. Bishop O'Toole, after reminding the gathering of what Vatican II said about the importance of preserving the use of Latin, stated that, 'It is important for us all to be able to sing parts of the Mass

together in Latin.’ However, he acknowledged that ‘sometimes there can be an ideology around this, as though one is trying to “turn the clock back”’. He continued: ‘Yet the point of Latin is not to make the rites impossible to understand; it is to make real the universality of the Church. Latin gives the Church a universal language. It frees us from being too narrow-minded and too centred on our own country or culture. It connects us with our history and gives us a sense of belonging to a world-wide community. There can be a powerful experience of the Church’s unity in this - across time and space’. We found this very encouraging and all the more significant for its episcopal delivery. One hopes the directors of music were similarly encouraged - or, where necessary, moved to change their practice.

(ii)

We’re now back in Melbourne. Liturgically, things are pretty good. St Patrick’s Cathedral has *two* sung Masses every Sunday: the 11am features a traditional, and very large, choir of men and boys and the 6.30pm a very good mixed adult choir. The repertoire is excellent (everything you might expect or hope for) and at each Mass a small schola from within the larger choir sings the Gregorian introit and/or communion antiphon. The Masses themselves are largely in English, although we do have congregational *Credo* and *Agnus Dei* - the former sometimes in Latin, the latter almost invariably so. All is offered with dignity and reverence, particularly at 11am, which is almost always celebrated by the Archbishop.

Melbourne also has a parish entirely dedicated to the EF with full sanction from the diocese. A small but good schola sings the proper, and the ordinary usually includes some congregational participation. In fact, it is interesting to see that, in a parish where the EF is the norm, some degree of participation arises very naturally. I have noticed the same thing at similar parishes in France; very different from the defiant non-participation of some LMS Masses I’ve attended!

An interesting intervention from Cardinal Sarah recently on *ad orientem*! Have you asked your parish priest if he will be changing

things around from the First Sunday of Advent?! Rome seemed to move pretty rapidly to disown the suggestion.

With very best wishes to you and all my friends at the ALL,

Anthony McClaran

Varia Latina

Two interesting articles about the Ordinariate of Our Lady of Walsingham appeared in the summer, one in the Autumn *Mass of Ages* [the magazine of the Latin Mass Society] and the other in the *Catholic Herald* of August 26. The first was a transcript of an interview with the Rt Revd Mgr Keith Newton, its Ordinary, who points out that when the commission *Anglicanae Traditiones* met, its members wanted liturgical material that came from historical Anglican sources and would be compatible with Catholic teaching and worship. Inevitably some of the things in *Divine Worship: The Missal* are not in the Roman Rite, for example the Collect for Purity and the Prayer of Humble Access. But Mgr Newton observes that, with all its various elements, the Ordinariate Mass has ‘a very formal, dignified and prayerful atmosphere’; and although the objectives of the ALL are linguistically fundamentally different to those of the Ordinariate, we do share many of the same aims with respect to what one might call the *tone* of the liturgy. The interviewer’s last question was about the forthcoming ‘celebrations’ of the 500th anniversary of Luther’s ‘Reformation’, of which Mgr Newton said: ‘I can understand why people would want to mark it, but I find it difficult to understand why we as Catholics would want to celebrate it. I think it was very sad that it happened ... I don’t see it as something that we could or should celebrate’.

Damian Thompson’s piece in the same *CH* was hard-hitting, with several references to the hostility with which some members of the Ordinariate feel they are regarded by the bishops of England and Wales. Their perception that they have been treated less than generously, and that the bishops really want them just to die out or be absorbed into the mainstream of bog-standard post-conciliar

English liturgy, is easy to understand. Thompson can foresee a future for the Ordinariate, though only if its most pressing problems (not the least of them financial) can be sorted out.

The Chairman had a letter published in *The Tablet* of June 11, as follows: 'In your interesting editorial this week you observe that insufficient use has been made of the option to celebrate Mass in the post-Vatican II Latin version rather than the vernacular. It has not been for want of trying! Since it was formed in 1969, the Association for Latin Liturgy has worked tirelessly for that very thing. We publish books, CDs and Gregorian chant Mass booklets, and offer assistance to any parish wishing to inaugurate or revive the modern Latin rite, not as a 'special event', but as a normal Mass in any church. The Bishops of England and Wales recognised the Association in 1970 as an approved Catholic Society, and in 1975 Pope Paul VI conferred on it the Apostolic Benediction.' One of the other letters printed on the same subject described the appointment by Pope Francis of Cardinal Robert Sarah as 'surprising and opaque'. The author, only co-incidentally no doubt, was a former editor of *The Tablet*.

The Autumn edition of *Pluscarden Benedictines* included an (unsigned) article entitled 'Why Latin?' The daily Mass (Ordinary Form) and Office at Pluscarden are entirely in Latin, except for the readings. 'Such use of Latin', comments the writer, 'gives a distinctive character to our community'. Three reasons influence this choice: obedience to the Church, living contact with tradition and the experience of prayer. 'Latin has a certain weight, strength and beauty which makes it very suitable for worship. People simply like praying in Latin, today no less than in past centuries'.

Despite its high price, we can recommend the T & T Clark Companion to Liturgy, edited by Alcuin Reid, reviewed in the *Catholic Herald* of 7 October by Fr Hugh Somerville-Knapman OSB, who described it as 'undoubtedly a required resource for liturgy studies'. Among the many distinguished contributors are two members of the ALL, Mgr Bruce Harbert and Fr James Leachman OSB. A further compendium from the same editor is 'Liturgy in the Twenty-First Century', of which the publishers (also T & T Clark)

say: 'Its contributors identify and address contemporary challenges and issues facing the task of realising the vision of Cardinal Sarah, Cardinal Ratzinger/Benedict XVI and the Second Vatican Council'. Some of the contributors spoke at *Sacra Liturgia*.

Christopher Howse in his Saturday *Daily Telegraph* column had two particularly interesting pieces. On August 20 he wrote about the church of St Ignatius Loyola in Preston, which the Jesuits built in 1833, though they had already been active in Preston (a resolutely Catholic area through penal times) since 1701. The architect was J J Scoles (responsible for Farm Street church), whose work was further developed by J A Hansom. Gerard Manley Hopkins served as a priest at St Ignatius in 1882. But the church was closed by the diocese in 2014 and, despite its architectural distinction, it faced a future of dereliction. However, for once this is a Catholic church closure story that has a happy ending, since St Ignatius is to become the Cathedral of the Syro-Malabar Catholics in England. The Syro-Malabar Church follows the Chaldean rite that originated in Persia, its original language being Syriac, a form of Aramaic that Jesus and His disciples spoke, which was brought to South India by Christians from Persia in the fourth century. Until 1962, this liturgy was celebrated in Syriac, since when various Indian languages have been used.

The following week, Mr Howse's column featured what is apparently the only colour image of pre-reformation liturgy in Westminster Abbey. The picture is actually a 1743 copy of the original, now lost, which was painted in the mortuary roll of Abbot John Islip (†1522). It shows the community before the high altar, above which hangs the cylindrical pyx containing the Blessed Sacrament, veiled in rose-coloured silk. The Rood, later destroyed with nearly everything else by protestants and puritans, is visible above, painted in vivid colours, as also are the statues beneath it. (The hostility of the reformers towards colour of any kind in churches is in itself quite sinister.) The huge hearse, festooned with candles, of the late Abbot towers above the monks, five times their height. Above the altar are inscribed the words *Adoramus te Christe, et benedicimus tibi*.

The Tablet, in its edition of June 4, resumed its attack on the revised English translation of the Mass, as it occasionally does. To that journal, the subject is like a favourite bone to which a dog returns from time to time, to have another chew at it. After some harsh words ('centralisation, inflexibility and a cloth ear for language') the writer proposes, as an extension of the liturgical plurality created by Pope Benedict's liberation of the 1962 Missal, and of the further variety provided by the Ordinariate liturgy, that the use of the pre-2011 translation should also now be permitted as another option.

The Congregation of the Oratory in England featured largely in the *Catholic Herald* of May 13, after it had been announced that a new Oratory would be opening in Bournemouth, at the invitation of Bishop Philip Egan. The church (dedicated to the Sacred Heart) will be open for Eucharistic adoration throughout the day. A longer article in the same issue pointed out that though the liturgical tone of the English Oratories is marked by beauty and Latinity, that is only one part of the explanation for their present flourishing, visible in their many novices and in the new communities at Manchester, York and Cardiff, as well as Bournemouth. The work of Oratorian priests among the poor, the dispossessed and prisoners is just as important as, and is totally in harmony with, their dignified and devotional liturgy.

John Hoban 1926-2016

John Hoban, who died on 10 November 2016, was director of music at Brompton Oratory from 1971 to 1995. Coming from Holy Redeemer Chelsea, where he had been choirmaster for seventeen years, he had been before that a lay clerk at Westminster Cathedral, where he sang under George Malcolm. Had fate decreed otherwise he could have been singing under Henry Washington at the Cathedral (Washington and Fernand Laloux of Farm Street were two of the other applicants when Malcolm was appointed). Instead John Hoban went on to succeed Henry Washington at the Oratory. It was soon after his appointment that I 'discovered' the wonderful services there, but was rather taken

aback by the distinctly robust style of singing. In the fullness of time this mellowed.

A number of recordings were made at the beginning of Hoban's time there, notably of Dvorak's *Mass in D*, one of the few recordings really to capture the sound of the Oratory organ as it strikes the worshipper in the nave. The soprano soloist in this recording was Hoban's wife, Mavis Beattie, whose luminous tones graced many a Mass setting in that building. She also enhances Hoban's recording of Mendelssohn's *Lauda Sion*, this time featuring the Oratory's newly-appointed organist Patrick Russill, who avers that Hoban's most distinctive contribution both inside and outside the Oratory lay in his devotion to and insight into the Spanish repertoire - Victoria above all - referring to the 1975 recording of Victoria's *Missa pro victoria* as a revelation. He adds: 'And I don't think anyone else in the 1970s was performing Guerrero or Cererols, for example.'

It has been noted that many Oratory singers go on to great things. The other side of the *Missa pro Victoria* LP featured Palestrina's then recently-discovered Mass *Tu es Petrus*, and the line-up of 18 singers (all credited) reads like a list of the great and the good, among them Rachel Bevan, sister of the Association for Latin Liturgy's music adviser Tony Bevan, musicologist Sally Dunkley, distinguished counter-tenor Christopher Robson, renowned tenor Edgar Fleet, Gilbert and Sullivan stalwart Richard Suart, BBC producer Mark Rowlinson, distinguished baritone David Wilson-Johnson, Gregory Rose, son of Bernard Rose and a renowned choral conductor, Deborah Roberts of the Tallis Scholars, Nancy Long of the Huelgas Ensemble, Mary Nichols of Anthony Rooley's Consort of Musicke, and English National Opera principals Julian Gavin and Stuart Kale. Also Olive Simpson, future member of the Swingle Singers, who on a more conventionally religious occasion was introduced to Prince Charles and revealed where she usually sang. "And is that a good choir?" enquired HRH. Well, we all know the answer to that one, and we all know why.

Singers with the enormous range of talents described above melded into a glorious whole at the Oratory. And under John Hoban, as under his successors Andrew Carwood and Patrick Russill, they led the congregation to the throne of God. I cannot

begin to count the blessings I have received through attending Solemn Mass and Vespers there on numerous occasions, the comfort I have been given, or the sheer Christian joy I have experienced. And, thank God, it continues.

Let the Oratory's obituarist have the last word: "John was an open-hearted man of great emotional loyalty and generosity, qualities he readily inspired in his friends and colleagues. The current shape and good estate of the Oratory's choral music is in large measure indebted to his energy, powers of persuasion and musical skill. *Requiescat in pace.*"

Ian Wells

Aquinas translated?

There is a story told in one of our Catholic Colleges (and probably in all of them) which throws, it is to be feared, a sinister light upon the easy familiarity with which altar-boys, choirs, and even congregations patter out their ecclesiastical Latin. A boy in a Latin class was exhibiting a mulish ignorance as to the meaning of the word *tantus*, and the class master, with that fatal tendency we all have to adopt the method of cross-examination, was trying to get the right meaning out of him. At last in despair he suggested: "Well, you have met the words *Tantum ergo Sacramentum* before; at least you know what *that* means." At which a great light dawned upon the boy, and he said: "Oh, yes, sir, I know *that*: It means 'Down in adoration falling.' " Most Catholic schoolmasters have had similar, if not quite so poignant experiences.

Ronald Knox

(from his foreword to J E Lowe's *Church Latin for Beginners*, 1923)

APPENDIX

Association for Latin Liturgy Cash Receipts & Payments for the year 6 April 2015 to 5 April 2016

Receipts		Payments	
2014/15	2015/16	2014/15	2015/16
£	£	£	£
1,856 Subscriptions	2,781	57 Printing of publications/stock purchase	193
0 Donations	7,100	N/A <i>Graduale Parvum</i>	665
392 Sales of Publications/Compact discs	380	0 P & P on publications	136
540 Meetings	1,220	0 Internet costs/software	100
4 Bank Interest	4	984 <i>Latin Liturgy</i> (inc postage)	923
0 Royalties	0	1,983 Meetings	1,893
633 Income Tax Repayments	887	135 Advertising/Promotion	246
0 Miscellaneous	0	0 Purchase of publications	27
3,425 Total receipts	12,372	3,159 Total payments	4,183
		266 Difference between receipts & payments	8,189
<u>3,425</u>	<u>12,372</u>	<u>3,425</u>	<u>12,372</u>
Cash capital		£	
Opening balance at 6 April 2015		9,951	
Surplus (-Defecit) for the year		8,189	
Closing balance at 5 April 2016		<u>18,140</u>	

Report by the Treasurer:

I certify that the above Cash Receipts & Payments Account and Cash Capital Balance Sheet have both been prepared in accordance with the books and vouchers of the Association.

Bernard Marriott (Treasurer)

ASSOCIATION FOR LATIN LITURGY

Founded in 1969 to encourage and extend the use of Latin
in the liturgy of the Catholic Church
Under the patronage of the Bishops' Conference of England & Wales

Officers of the Association:

Chairman	Christopher Francis 16 Brean Down Avenue Bristol BS9 4JF <i>Christopher.Francis@Latin-Liturgy.org</i>
Vice-Chairman	Fr Guy Nicholls Cong Orat
Treasurer	Bernard Marriott 47 Western Park Road, Leicester LE3 6HQ <i>Bernard.Marriott@Latin-Liturgy.org</i>
Membership Secretary	Brendan Daintith 173 Davidson Road Croydon CR0 6DP <i>Brendan.Daintith@Latin-Liturgy.org</i>

Members of the Association's Council:

Liam Carpenter, Laura Dance,
Mgr Bruce Harbert, Graeme Jolly, Alastair Tocher,
Fr Anton Webb Cong Orat, Ben Whitworth

Website	www.Latin-Liturgy.org
Facebook	www.facebook.com/latinliturgy
Twitter	@latinliturgyuk
<i>Latin Liturgy</i>	Editor: Christopher Francis

Orders for publications should be sent to:

ALL, 47 Western Park Road, Leicester LE3 6HQ
or
Sales@Latin-Liturgy.org

***Latin Liturgy* No 150 copyright © 2017 Association for Latin Liturgy, except where
otherwise acknowledged. Reproduction, by whatever means, requires written
permission.**

