



LATIN LITURGY

No. 147

Paschaltide 2015

Two day Summer Meeting at Buckfast Abbey	2
Notice of the 2015 AGM	3
Changes in subscription rates	3
Obituary: Edward Barrett	5
Members' email addresses	7
2014 Annual General Meeting	7
From the Press	8
Signs of the Holy One: Liturgy, Ritual and the Expression of the Sacred	12
News from Nowhere	16
Letter to the Editor	18
Extraordinary Faith	19
Review: Lumen Christi Missal	20
Silver Jubilee	22
Laser printer appeal	22
'When Mass is said in English'	23
Appendix: Financial Statement	27

**Active Involvement in the Chant! Sing from the *Graduale Parvum* at our two-day meeting at Buckfast Abbey this summer:
Monday 17 – Tuesday 18 August**

The Association's meeting for 2015 marks a *completely new departure* for us. It will take the form of a short summer school over two days, at the School of the Annunciation, Buckfast Abbey, Buckfastleigh, Devon, TQ11 0EE. Website: schooloftheannunciation.com. The meeting will run from lunchtime on Monday 17 August to lunchtime on Tuesday 18, and the cost, including one night's accommodation at the School's residential centre, breakfast, and the use of the School's facilities will be £80 per person. The cost of two lunches and one supper in the Abbey restaurant will be additional to this, costing in the region of £10-£15 for lunch and from £15-£25 for supper, depending on which options guests choose.

The accommodation we have reserved is available to members on a **first-come, first-served basis**, and we cannot promise to be able to secure accommodation at the Abbey for late applicants. So speedy booking is advised! A booking form is enclosed. [Please note that if a booking is later cancelled, we will only be able to give a refund if the place can be filled by someone else.]

Members who would like to extend their stay at the Abbey, or to take in the meeting as part of a holiday in the West Country, can contact the School of the Annunciation direct to book a further stay. Alternatively, there are several bed and breakfast establishments in the immediate vicinity.

Directions to Buckfast Abbey can be found by following the link on the School's website. If driving, the postcode for satnavs is TQ11 0EE. There is a regular bus service to the Abbey from Totnes: see www.cartogold.co.uk/devon_transport/devon. It is also possible to reach Buckfastleigh by steam train, changing from the main line at Totnes. See: www.southdevonrailway.co.uk/timetable

The meeting will focus on active involvement in chant, using chants from the work in progress on the *Graduale Parvum*, currently the ALL's flagship project, and on an investigation of the 'untranslatable' elements of the Latin Missal. The chant workshops will be led by Fr Guy Nicholls, and will culminate in participation in the sung Mass on the Tuesday, while the theme for the translation workshop will be: "Hidden Treasures: what no translation

can ever tell us.” In these sessions, led by Mgr Bruce Harbert, we will investigate elements in the original Latin which cannot be carried over into the vernacular. *Participants should bring with them a copy of the Ordo Missae (Ordinary Form) in Latin and English.* If these are not readily to hand, copies are usually available for purchase in the Abbey’s excellent bookshop. The music for the chant workshops will be provided, and is included in the fee.

Please fill in the enclosed form, and send it, by 1st July at the latest, with a cheque for £80 payable to Association for Latin Liturgy, to The Treasurer, ALL, 47 Western Park Road, Leicester, LE3 6HQ.

**Notice of the 2015 AGM, which will take place
during the Buckfast meeting. Agenda:**

1. Chairman’s Report.
2. Treasurer’s Report. An Income and Expenditure Account and Balance Sheet for the year ending 5 April 2015 will be distributed at the meeting.
3. Subscription Rates for 2015/16. Current rates of subscription are:

- Members in the UK: £15
- Members in the rest of Europe: £20
- Members outside Europe: £25
- Reduced rate in the UK and rest of Europe (for priests, religious, students, persons under 18, and retired): £8
- Joint membership – for those living in the UK at the same address, with two copies being sent in the same mailing: £18

Council has concluded that mainly because of sharply rising printing and postal costs, resulting in a significant decrease in the Association’s assets, it is essential that subscriptions be increased this year. This will be the first increase since 2007. There will no longer be a reduced rate for retired persons, or for any members in Europe but outside the UK; the reduced rate will now only apply to UK clergy and students. The approval of the AGM is needed for these changes, and a vote will be taken at that meeting. The increases proposed by Council are as follows:

- UK ordinary membership: £15 to £20.
- UK clergy and students: £8 to £12.
- Two members receiving two copies of *Latin Liturgy* at the same address: £18 to £25.
- Members in Europe but outside the UK: **remaining at £20 when members receive *Latin Liturgy* by email, but increased to £25 if they wish to continue receiving printed copies in the post.**
- Members outside Europe: ***reduced* to £20 if receiving *Latin Liturgy* by email, but increased to £30 if members wish to continue receiving printed copies in the post.**

Overseas members wishing to subscribe at the lower rate of £20 must send their e-mail addresses to the Editor at:
christopher.francis@latin-liturgy.org

[There are currently no plans to replace the printed *Latin Liturgy* sent to UK members with an electronic copy.]

4. Election of Council for 2015/2016. For perhaps the first time in our history, our AGM is not being held in October, but it is possible that in 2016 we shall return to that month; in any case, the elections made this year will have effect until the 2016 AGM. The Constitution allows for the AGM to take place ‘on any date between April and October inclusive,’ and provides for a Council with a maximum of twelve members, three of whom shall hold the offices of Chairman, Vice-Chairman and Treasurer, with the others being ordinary members. The three Officers retire annually; Ordinary Members serve for periods of two years. All are eligible for immediate re-election. The Council has power to co-opt ordinary members to serve for two years, provided that the maximum number of Council members is not exceeded.

The current Chairman, Christopher Francis, and Treasurer, Bernard Marriott, are accordingly retiring, but are willing to stand for immediate re-election. Following the very recent and greatly lamented death of our Vice-Chairman, Edward Barrett (see obituary below) Fr Guy Nicholls (already previously elected until 2016) has kindly agreed to stand for that office. The following Ordinary Members are also standing for re-election: Fr Kevin Hale, Ben Whitworth, Brendan Daintith and Graeme Jolly. Mgr Bruce Harbert (co-opted

until October) is also standing for election. In addition, Laura Dance has been co-opted by the Council for a period of two years. Laura, who works in the home Civil Service, is an Oxford classicist. Also previously elected until 2016 is Fr Anton Webb, and Alastair Tocher is co-opted until 2016.

Any member may make alternative nominations for any of these positions. If you feel able to make a contribution to the running of the Association by being a Council member or in any other way, you are invited to discuss this with the Chairman (0117 962 3558). The names of nominees, whose prior consent must be obtained, and those of proposer and seconder, must be received by the Chairman not later than Monday 10 August 2015.

5. General discussion. Any member wishing to put a motion to the Business Meeting must notify the Chairman in writing or by e-mail by 10 August, giving the name and address of a member who has agreed to second it. But it is open to any member to raise topics informally under this item.

Edward Barrett

We report with great sorrow that Edward Barrett died on Friday 20 March 2015, following an operation.

Edward joined the Association in September 1978, at the age of 44. On the back of his record card, Ruth Richens wrote: “Will help in any way, when he has seen how we operate.” He must have been impressed with the way we operated, as he became a Council member in 1981, Vice-Chairman for a year in 1983 and 1986, and then served continuously in that role from 1994 until his death.

Edward very soon became *de facto* the Association’s MC. He had an all-embracing knowledge of the liturgy and how it is to be celebrated, and an easy, yet purposeful, way of dealing with servers and celebrants. He was married 53 years ago at St Mary’s, Cadogan Street, Chelsea, where we held our AGM in 2004, and where he was MC for many decades right up to the present. The solemn Mass there had remained in Latin through the years, sustained by the zealous choir and by another of our members producing a congregational sheet each week with the texts of the Mass in Latin and English, a feat unequalled anywhere else, to the best of our knowledge. With this background, when the number of Sunday Masses was reduced from seven

to four, Edward was able to obtain agreement for the Solemn Mass to be retained as it was, albeit at a later time. He also did not allow the old rite to fade from memory, and was involved in an annual sung Mass in the summer when things were quieter than usual.

Situated as it is, St Mary's is visited by many clergy, often eminent men, and Edward was able to guide them through a celebration in a language with which, regrettably, they were not always familiar. There is every reason to think that they found the experience uplifting, and will bring this to bear on future celebrations, wherever they may go.

Edward regularly attended the sung Mass in Latin each Saturday morning at Westminster Cathedral, and many of the major ceremonies at the London Oratory, when he was not otherwise engaged at St Mary's. This gave him an almost unrivalled knowledge of the Latin liturgy in London, and many knowledgeable contacts, the range of whom was greatly enlarged with the coming of the internet. This wide knowledge was put to very good use when Edward took over the Editorship of our Newsletter, a post which he adorned with great distinction from 2002 to 2009. Editing the Newsletter brought to the fore Edward's consummate ability at analysing events, registering important detail, and painting pen-portraits of liturgical events. Much of his work may be viewed on our website; and for a reminder of his perception and fluent prose, members should re-read 'The Benedictine legacy' which appeared in *Latin Liturgy* in September 2013.

In addition, Edward was a gifted and able linguist, being able to cope at least competently (and often very much more than that) in a variety of European languages; evidence of this was regularly seen when he translated material for the Newsletter, and when he was able to comment authoritatively on documents not available in English.

He was brought up in Leicester and would doubtless have taken a keen interest in the re-interment of Richard III, ceremonies for which began on 22 March.

Edward's personal qualities endeared him to all of us in the Association. His rich, deep voice, great warmth of personality and often mischievous sense of humour invariably made Council meetings at which he was present enjoyable experiences. He will be sorely missed by all who knew him.

Edward, *In paradisum deducant te Angeli.*

Members' e-mail addresses

Because of enormous increases in the costs of printing and postage in the last few years, the time has inevitably come when the Association must be enabled to communicate with its members by e-mail. With this channel of communication the Council will be able to contact members at short notice, for example to alert them to liturgical and other events taking place before the next edition of *Latin Liturgy* appears. Do not be alarmed, though: you will not be deluged with messages, or with offers of liturgical texts for sale. In fact you will hear from us quite rarely. But the resource is one which, inescapably, we need to have. You can be assured that the addresses will *not* be divulged to *any* third party.

Please therefore e-mail your address, with a brief covering note, to membership@latin-liturgy.org

2014 Annual General Meeting

This took place at the Church of Our Lady of the Angels, Bayswater, London, on Saturday 11 October, by courtesy of the Parish Priest, Mgr Keith Barltrop. The Mass was a Requiem for the repose of the soul of Jeremy de Satgé, celebrated by Fr Gregory Pearson OP. The sermon was preached by Fr Ola Craig, who formerly served at Holy Ghost Church, Balham, where Jeremy was Director of Music before moving to Bayswater. The choir consisted of members of the Newman Consort, singing Anerio's *Missa pro Defunctis*, and Byrd's *Justorum animae*.

Lunch followed in the well-appointed parish room, formerly the refectory of the Oblates of St Charles Borromeo, the founders of the church. In the afternoon, Fr Uwe Michael Lang of the London Oratory spoke on 'Ritual and

the Sacred in the Catholic Liturgy'. Fr Lang has kindly allowed us to print, in advance of its publication, the introduction to his forthcoming book on that subject, and it appears later in this edition. The talk was followed by a lively question and answer session. In the formal part of the AGM, Council's recommendations, as to the election of Council officers and ordinary members, and maintenance of the current subscriptions, were adopted.

The day ended with Solemn First Vespers of the Sunday, and Benediction. Fr Anton presided, Fr Young exposing the Blessed Sacrament.

Bernard Marriott

[Several Council members were prevented by illness from attending this meeting, and so a heavy burden fell on the few who did, and valiantly held the breach. We offer them our grateful thanks – Editor]

From the Press

Last August, too late for the last edition of *Latin Liturgy*, a letter from ALL member Susan Carson-Rowland was printed in *The Catholic Herald*. The subject was the vexed one of the Sign of Peace. There are several schools of thought on this peculiar feature (congregationally speaking) of the post-conciliar rite, ranging from outright loathing to heated enthusiasm. Rome periodically attempts to rein in excessive displays of ardour (the super-emotional hugging and kissing, the wandering celebrants and all the rest) at this supposedly prayerful pre-communion moment, and the Congregation for Divine Worship had just issued one of those attempts to correct 'abuses' (possibly too strong a term for what most of the time is just silliness). 'Why can't we just bow?' wrote Mrs Carson-Rowland. 'Hand-shaking is not a liturgical gesture, and simply encourages the idea of the Sign of Peace as a social greeting. Spouses no doubt feel ridiculous shaking hands...The exchange between the people is so fraught with exaggerations and misunderstandings that, optional as it's always been, it would be better to exclude it altogether. We can wish the peace of the Lord to each other without 'acting it out' like a class of infants.' We can only agree with her.

In the 21 November edition of *The Catholic Herald* Fr Leo Chamberlain OSB contributed a long and most interesting article entitled ‘We can live with the new Mass translation’. Here are a few phrases to give the flavour of it: ‘The first translation we used for a year or two is hardly remembered, but the prairie tortoise – “the prayer he taught us” – sticks in the mind.’ [See ‘When Mass is said in English,’ later in this edition.] ‘The tortoise shuffled away when something better was ready, the first work of the special committee, ICEL...I shared [the initial enthusiasm] but over the years became increasingly discontented. We simply did not have what the Latin said. And for the Mass, the Latin is the original: it did not come out of thin air...Chomsky, it is said, abandoned the theory of dynamic equivalence in the end. The new translators have looked for formal equivalence...For fifty years we have had a translation which completely lost the atmosphere, the sense of reverence and the depth of reference, in the Latin...We should have more reverence for the Latin texts, mostly very ancient, than the translators offered in the 1960s. There is a CTS pamphlet by Mgr Bruce Harbert, which offers a helpful and detailed explanation of the texts we have, and brings out the wealth of biblical reference, something almost suppressed in the translation of the 1960s...We can be grateful for what we have now. It’s not perfect, but it’s good, and perfection will only happen in the heavenly liturgy.’

Fr Leo also writes on the revision of the lectionary, and the question of which version of the scriptures to use, over which there is no agreement. ‘A revised lectionary could have been published along with the new translation of the Mass. But the indecision has meant that churches now have tatty lectionaries badly needing replacement and newly printed people’s missals with the sadly inadequate translation of the readings from the original English version of the Jerusalem Bible of the early 1960s.’

In this connection, the 18 October edition of *The Tablet* reported the disbanding of the International Commission for the Preparation of an English Language Lectionary, whose brief was precisely to replace the Jerusalem Bible lectionary. The Holy See, copyright holders and bishops’ conferences had all failed to agree, and so everyone (except for the relatively few parishes which use the RSV) is stuck with the now totally discredited Jerusalem version until further notice. As Dom Hugh Somerville-Knapman OSB of Douai Abbey commented, ‘this is a pity, as the Jerusalem Bible makes some shocking theological and exegetical decisions, and is far too banal for liturgical proclamation.’ The Liturgy Office was not available for comment.

Fr Leo appeared again, on the letters page of *The Tablet* of 21 March, with a well-reasoned defence, opening with these telling words: ‘You have been critical of the new translation of the Mass...and I do not recall your publishing a single letter or article in its defence. That may reflect your readership rather than the Church at large.’ And how true that is: *The Tablet*’s vendetta against the new translation has reached absurd proportions, scarcely a week passing without some ill-natured complaint appearing.

The most notable occurrence in the Catholic press since our last issue has been *The Catholic Herald*’s transformation of itself from a broadsheet newspaper into a magazine, the first issue appearing on 5 December last. So far the signs are promising. The format is compact but spacious enough for photographs to show up well (there is a lot of colour) in good definition. The content is lively, with rather more depth in some articles than in the old newspaper. The strap line on the front cover is ‘What’s really happening in the Catholic Church’ - something we all wish we knew - and there have been some quite penetrating articles on contentious issues. Of course, following its re-formatting, the *CH* is now very similar in appearance to *The Tablet* (the latter is an inch taller) but the two organs continue to inhabit two almost completely separate ecclesiastical worlds.

The first magazine issue of the *CH* contained one notable story, hilarious or scandalous according to your point of view: “A UKIP official expressed fury on Twitter last week about BBC bias, when a journalist filmed a report about the party outside a London mosque. Or so the UKIP commentator thought. In fact, the mosque was Westminster Cathedral.”

The appointment last November of Cardinal Robert Sarah as Prefect of the Congregation for Divine Worship and Discipline of the Sacraments was fairly widely reported, though there seemed to be some uncertainty as to the line he would take on liturgical issues. A clue was given by an interview he gave in Paris, reported in *The Tablet* of 14 March, in which he insisted that rancour must be avoided in disputes within the Church over the Ordinary and Extraordinary Forms of the Mass. Emphasising the importance of the Mass of St Pius V, of Latin and of Vatican II’s reforms, the Cardinal said that it was vital to respect the sensitivity of others, and this had been the intention of Benedict XVI in *Summorum Pontificum*.

Fr John Zuhldorf, who had a very long-running series of articles on the prayers of the Mass in the old-style *CH*, now has a shorter column entitled

‘Omnium gatherum.’ I learn from the internet that Omnium Gatherum is also ‘a six-piece melodic death metal band from Finland,’ but never mind. Anyway, in the 6 February issue *Fr* Zuhlsdorf wrote a very nice little piece beginning ‘Our liturgical year synchronises the clocks of our days with the clock of the heavens.’ Of the pre-Lent season of Septuagesima he writes: ‘There was a tradition of ‘burying’ the Alleluia in a *depositio* ceremony, like a little funeral. A hymn of farewell was sung. There was a procession with crosses, lighted tapers, holy water, and a coffin containing a banner inscribed with ‘Alleluia.’ The coffin was incensed and buried...’ ‘In the *Novus Ordo* of Paul VI there is no pre-Lent observance. This is a terrible loss which should be corrected.’

The present Pontiff mentions the liturgy far less frequently than his illustrious predecessor, so it was interesting to read in the *CH* of 27 February what he said on the subject to priests of the Diocese of Rome (we cannot vouch for the accuracy of the translation): “For me the key of *ars celebrandi* takes the path of recovering the allure of beauty, the wonder both of the person celebrating and the people, of entering into an atmosphere that is spontaneous, normal and religious, but isn’t artificial, and that way you recover a bit of the wonder...If the priest is ‘excessively’ focused on the rubrics that indicate the movements and particular gestures during Mass, and ‘rigid’, I do not enter into the mystery, because all one’s attention is on the form. The other extreme is if I am a showman, the protagonist of the Mass, then I do not enter into the mystery either.”

The running sore of the now non-existent holydays of obligation continues to agitate some writers, notably the *CH*’s ‘Pastor Iuventus’ (‘The Great Holy Days Surrender’) *CH* 9 January, though it is hard to imagine the bishops ever giving way on this one. As events from the sixties onwards have shown, it is easy to abolish a practice, but very hard, if not impossible, to bring it back. The *CH* pointed out, in the same 9 January edition, that there will be no weekday holydays of obligation *at all* in 2015, apart from Christmas Day, which the bishops have for some reason refrained from moving to the nearest Sunday. This is because, of the seven holy days in England and Wales, the feasts of Our Lord (apart from Christmas) were transferred to the Sunday in 2006. The other three, Ss Peter and Paul, the Assumption and All Saints fall on Saturday, Sunday and Monday this year, but because of a rule dating back to 1986 are also transferred to the nearest Sunday.

Finally, our thanks to Council member Brendan Daintith for his letter printed in the *CH* last November, remembering our late friend and colleague Jeremy de Satgé.

CF

Signs of the Holy One: Liturgy, Ritual and the Expression of the Sacred

[As stated earlier, what follows is the introduction to Fr Uwe Michael Lang's forthcoming book with the above title, which we are printing here for the first time, with his kind permission.]

This book is the fruit of reflection on two sets of questions, which I consider essential for understanding the liturgy of the Western (Latin) Church, above all the Roman Rite, and its predicament in the contemporary world. The first set of questions emerges from the observation that the Church's solemn public worship speaks through a variety of 'languages' other than language in the literal sense. These languages correspond to what the English social anthropologist Mary Douglas has described as 'non-verbal symbols', which 'are capable of creating a structure of meanings in which individuals can relate to one another and realise their own ultimate purposes.' The years when I was working for the Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments in Rome (2008-2012) have sharpened my awareness of how important these non-linguistic or symbolic expressions are for the celebration of the Paschal Mystery, and I am convinced that they are more significant than language itself.

This would seem evident in today's world, which is dominated by images: on television, on computer screens, and on the ubiquitous mobile devices. We need to take account of the fact that we live in a 'culture of images', as Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger wrote in his introduction to the *Compendium* of the *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, which he later approved as Pope. Today, the image tends to make a deeper and more lasting impression on people than the spoken word.

The power of the image has long been known in the Church's liturgical tradition, which has used sacred art and architecture as a medium of expression and communication. This has been noted by the (Lutheran)

liturgical scholar Frank Senn in his enlightened discussion of the laity's participation in worship during the Middle Ages. In more recent times Senn observes a tendency to see 'liturgy only as text' and to limit participation in it to 'speaking roles.' Affected by this tendency in the modern age, a broad stream of liturgical scholarship has focused on texts that are contained in written sources from late antiquity and the early Middle Ages, above all the oldest available sacramentaries. This approach is legitimate, at least to some extent, because the Church's public worship is ordered by the official texts she uses for it. Moreover, documents of the early liturgy are few, and the texts that have come down to us are our primary witnesses. However, even in the best scholarship of the last century, including that of Josef Andreas Jungmann, author of the magisterial work *Missarum Sollemnia*, on the Mass of the Roman Rite, it seems sometimes forgotten that the liturgy is not simply 'a series of texts to be read, but rather a series of sacred actions to be done', as the musicologist and musician William P. Mahrt writes. 'The solemn Mass consists of an integrated complex of words, music, and movement, together with other visual and even olfactory elements.' Mahrt published this analysis in 1975; since then progress has been made in the field, and scholars have taken note of the wider perspective of liturgical 'vernaculars' evoked by Senn, which spoke so eloquently to worshippers in ages past.

The tendency to see liturgy primarily as text can also be observed on the official level: much of the reform of the Roman liturgy since the Second Vatican Council has been concerned with producing revised or new texts with insufficient regard for the complexity of ritual. In fact, leading exponents of social anthropology and ritual studies have been critical of the post-conciliar reform because of an apparent insensitivity to non-verbal signals and their meaning, above all Victor Turner, whose contributions will be discussed in the first chapter. Mary Douglas, a professed Catholic like Turner, wrote in the aftermath of the Council: 'This is central to the difficulties of Christianity today. It is as if the liturgical signal boxes were manned by colour-blind signalmen.' It was the merit of James Hitchcock's *The Recovery of the Sacred* (1974) to show to a broader audience the significance of ritual studies for understanding the liturgy and for evaluating the contemporary efforts of its renewal. David Torevell has taken up this approach in a more systematic manner in his *Losing the Sacred: Ritual, Modernity and Liturgical Reform* (2000).

The Holy See has been mainly occupied with the *recognitio* of liturgical texts and translations. This is necessary and important, and some sterling work has

been produced in recent years, especially the revision of the post-conciliar translation of the *Missale Romanum*, most notably in the English language. However, such legitimate emphasis tends to underestimate that the *lex orandi* expressing the *lex credendi* is much more than just text: it includes gestures and postures, movements and processions, music, architecture, art, and so on. An example of this tendency would be the 1970 *editio typica* of the *Missale Romanum* of Pope Paul VI. Unlike preceding editions of the Missal going back to the medieval manuscript tradition, the book contains only the liturgical texts, with no musical notation at all. This lacuna has been addressed to some degree in the third *editio typica* of 2002, which has many texts in musical notation, but still not all the Prefaces that form part of the *Ordo Missae*. Hence a solemn celebration of the Ordinary Form of the Roman Rite in Latin on a ‘green’ Sunday in the liturgical year still needs to resort to other books, such as the Solesmes version of the *Ordo Missae in cantu*. The institution of a new office within the Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments on 14 November 2012, dedicated to liturgical music and art, is a sign of hope that more attention will be given to these essential aspects of the Church’s *lex orandi*.

The second set of questions emerges from my work in the subject areas of sacred music, art and architecture. During my years in Rome I taught for (and for three years directed) the Master’s degree course in ‘Architecture, Sacred Arts and Liturgy’ at the *Università Europea di Roma*. Initially, this work focused on the concept of beauty and its theological dimension. However, the problem became more and more evident to me that, in the context of modernity, one can reason about beauty only to a very limited extent. Beauty has been reduced to a subjective judgment and for those who do not share the presuppositions of the classical philosophical tradition, it remains an elusive concept. When it comes to church architecture, for instance, recourse to beauty will not carry us very far. We may not think that Renzo Piano’s church of St Pius of Pietrelcina in San Giovanni Rotondo works *as* a church, but how do we respond to someone who finds its architectural forms, or the space it creates for the assembly, ‘beautiful’?

For these reasons I propose that any discussion of sacred architecture, art and music needs to be clear about what is meant by the attribute ‘sacred.’ Social anthropology and ritual studies have dedicated much attention to the question of the sacred, and it will be useful to give an overview of this complex and diverse conversation (Chapter I).

While the category of the sacred often seems to be taken for granted, its significance for Christianity has been contested, or even rejected. Hence its theological foundations need to be revisited and, where necessary, reconstructed. The task is not straightforward and must include an evaluation of Karl Rahner's contribution to the subject. At its conclusion, however, we arrive at a more mature understanding of what makes the liturgy sacred (Chapter II).

The following chapter explores how this renewed conception of the sacred can be translated into the design of churches. Particular attention will be given to questions raised by contemporary church building. The chapter ends with a proposal of theological principles to be observed in sacred architecture (Chapter III).

The search for beauty is resumed in the chapter on sacred art. The difficulty of this search in the philosophical context of modernity is felt very clearly. In the face of this *aporia* I shall attempt to sketch the elements of a theological response on the foundation of the Second Vatican Council's Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy and other documents of the Church's Magisterium (Chapter IV).

While the title of the following chapter, 'Between Theological Millstones' may appear overly dramatic, I contend that it adequately characterises the situation of church music today. The intimate relationship of sacred music with divine worship makes it particularly susceptible to tendentious theological impositions and sensitive to questionable cultural incursions. A brief historical overview will show that the contemporary problems concerning sacred music are not new, and will help to find ways towards a genuine renewal (Chapter V).

In this book I often engage with the thought of Joseph Ratzinger – Benedict XVI – both his writings as a theologian and his teachings as pope. The depth and breadth of these contributions make them indispensable for the on-going conversation about the sacred liturgy and its related fields.

News from Nowhere

If I say that this article is about *video*, then the more unworldly and musically erudite among you may think that I am about to devote the next few pages to the communion antiphon for St Stephen, *Video caelos apertos* (I saw the heavens opened). Well, since you mention it, let's start by listening to that haunting mode VIII antiphon, with its plangent evocation of the protomartyr's heavenward gaze. We can do so thanks to his modern namesake, Steve George. Mr George has taken recordings of dozens of items from the *Liber Usualis*, matched them with a scrolling visual image of the notation, and posted them to the popular video hosting site YouTube. We can hear *Video caelos* sung by the Schola of the Hofburgkapelle Vienna, and follow the score, at the following URL (web address): youtube.com/watch?v=IgE5apvJvtM. Similar collections of chant training videos include Marek Klein's "Graduale Project" (youtube.com/user/GradualeProject), and work produced by Corpus Christi Watershed (see below); both feature specially-made new recordings.

Streaming video (that is, video content which can be watched online, rather than having to be downloaded) has thus been found very useful as an aid to learning and studying Gregorian chant. In fact it can be used in all sorts of ways to disseminate information and ideas about the sacred liturgy. Talks that might have reached only a roomful of people in the past can now be seen by a global audience: one that will be of particular interest to ALL members is a lecture that the late Jeremy de Satgé gave in the USA in 2010, which can be seen at youtube.com/watch?v=MkWqtf9960I. Documentaries can shed a vivid light on aspects of liturgical history, such as this short film about an early printed Sarum Missal at Lyme Park: youtube.com/watch?v=c6yXPyaqGWg.

Hollywood has been to Mass on many occasions, and some examples can be seen – at least in excerpt – on the internet. Be moved (perhaps, like Deanna Durbin, to tears) by a beautiful midnight Mass in *Christmas Holiday* (1944): newliturgicalmovement.org/2014/12/was-your-christmas-mass-anything-like.html! Marvel at Robert de Niro's mastery of the rubrics of High Mass in *True Confessions* (1981): youtube.com/watch?v=cPjcBl48dwU! Cringe at Elvis Presley's contribution to liturgical music in *Change of Habit* (1969): youtube.com/watch?v=ghqSmy3h02I!

Most the examples I have shared so far are to be seen on YouTube. The way this website works is very simple; users sign up for an account, and they then have a "channel" on which to post their own videos. Anyone can have a channel, from the Vatican (youtube.com/user/vatican) to a teenager with a

smartphone. YouTube moderates content only retroactively, if a channel is reported for promoting hatred, say, or for infringement of copyright. If you want to avoid rubbish (or, frankly, filth), a good policy is to look for channels that consistently post good material. I would recommend, for example, the PapalMusic channel (youtube.com/user/PapalMusic), which posts only videos of music from Papal liturgies. PapalMusic has nearly 600 videos on YouTube, including excerpts from Pope Benedict's Mass at Westminster Cathedral, and his memorable celebration of Vespers at the Charterhouse of Serra San Bruno in 2011.

YouTube's biggest rival, Vimeo, supports high sound and picture quality, and tends to attract a smaller but more artistically ambitious community of users than YouTube. It has not been embraced quite so enthusiastically by those involved with Catholic liturgy. One notable exception is the American liturgical music publisher Corpus Christi Watershed (vimeo.com/ccwatershed). Their Vimeo account (boasting nearly 900 videos) includes chant learning aids similar to those described at the beginning of this article, promotional videos for CCW's (excellent) publications, and some short documentaries. A series of films on the Birmingham Oratory is narrated by the ALL's Fr Guy Nicholls: vimeo.com/channels/114151.

There is a video-hosting network devoted to Catholic material: Gloria.tv, which has the apparently reassuring motto, "The more Catholic the better." Certainly the site is free of the offensive videos that one might find on non-Catholic sites, but a *caveat* is still in order. The site notes that "Gloria.tv is a private initiative that is not directly connected to the hierarchy of the Catholic Church," and controversy has been caused in the past by the posting of polemical videos bitterly critical of certain bishops' conferences. The best content on Gloria.tv is free of this captious spirit. A report on the Gregorian Chant Network's annual chant course is worth seeing, for example: gloria.tv/media/uLdpc2n7Ngt. Of great historical interest are the recordings – posted by one "Firminus" (gloria.tv/user/ThBugxfQGt5) – of the peculiar plainsong and fauxbourdon traditions of Picardy, which managed to survive the French Revolution, the Romanising efforts of Dom Guéranger *and* Vatican II!

Besides these video-sharing platforms, there are websites belonging to film and television companies that have published their own video archives. One example is Pathé News (britishpathe.com), whose cinema newsreels included notable Catholic ceremonies over many decades. Brief as they are, these films are a unique record of events such as the consecration of Downside Abbey

Church in 1935 ([britishpathe.com/ video/downside-abbey/](http://britishpathe.com/video/downside-abbey/)) and Pope Paul VI's coronation ([britishpathe. com/video/pope-paul-is-crowned](http://britishpathe.com/video/pope-paul-is-crowned)). A silent, forty-second-long clip of a Mass at the Western Front is extraordinarily eloquent: [britishpathe.com/ video/priest-celebrates-mass-in-trenches](http://britishpathe.com/video/priest-celebrates-mass-in-trenches).

Streaming video technology has also, of course, made it possible to watch complete liturgies in the comfort of your own home. I will finish by directing your attention to three such videos. One is from the East – a slightly edited film of the Greek Divine Liturgy filmed at the historic monastery of the Merciful Mother of God at Veljusa, Macedonia, with the nuns providing the choir and congregation: [youtube.com/watch ?v=dToc9xPNHjA](http://youtube.com/watch?v=dToc9xPNHjA). One is from the past – Christmas midnight Mass from Ushaw College in 1962, when the seminary and junior seminary were at full capacity and in fine voice: offerimustibidomine.blogspot.co.uk/2015/01/high-mass-from-ushaw-college.html. And the third, this time the Mass of Christmas day, is as celebrated at Notre Dame Cathedral in Paris, where that great church's plainsong, *organum* and *grande orgue* traditions are all integrated into the Ordinary Form of the Roman Rite: youtube.com/watch?v=lvjeSLgKV4s.

You can find links to all these videos on my personal blog: benwhitworth.blogspot.co.uk. I should point out that the YouTube videos start playing automatically, so you may want to start with the volume turned down. Be sure also to look at the Association's facebook page (facebook.com/latinliturgy), which has been "liked" by over a thousand people already in less than a year. Quite an achievement!

Ben Whitworth

Letter to the Editor

Papal Errors

Sir, In these more ecumenical days, readers might smile at the barb in the following inscription, especially since the church, St John's, Oxborough, in which it is exhibited, is adjacent to Oxburgh House, seat of the staunchly Catholic Bedingfields. Trollope would no doubt have made something of the situation!

M.S.
CAROLI PARKYN
per XL annos hujusce Parochiae
Pastoris vigilantissimi, indefessi.
Munus in errores Papisteos
bene ac strenue susceptum
et Honori sibi
et alteris Exemplo inserviat.
Labore et studio laudabili
antiquam Norfolcensium Historiam
elucidare curavit.

Ob. Die xxvii. M. Sextilis
An. MDCCLXV. Aet. LXXV

[Sacred to the memory of Charles Parkyn, for 40 years a most vigilant and unwearying pastor of this parish. His campaign against Papist errors, well and energetically undertaken, should serve as both an honour to himself and an example to others. With praiseworthy toil and study, he took pains to elucidate the ancient history of the people of Norfolk. He died on August 27th 1765, in the 75th year of his age.]

David Miller

Extraordinary Faith

Bernard Marriott writes:

‘Extraordinary Faith’ is a monthly 30 minute television program on EWTN that centres on the beauty of classical Catholic sacred art, architecture, music, and liturgy. The programme makers sent a team to London to interview, amongst others, the Reverend Mother of Tyburn Convent, and also me on behalf of the Association. And so it was that I found myself in the crypt of Tyburn Convent on 13 October as the interview with the Reverend Mother was concluding. She had much to say of interest about the history of the convent, and the significance of the stained glass in the crypt.

I was confronted by four people: the producer with a clapper board, the cameraman, the interviewer, and the sound man who had a mobile sound desk slung from his neck like an usherette's tray of ice-cream at the cinema. The crypt is just above the Central Line, and we had to break off the interview every time a train passed, and start again from the beginning of the sentence which had been interrupted. The questions had been prepared in advance, so it was a straightforward interview on the history and work of the Association. I took a selection of our publications, and the camera panned over them, laid out on a desk. The interviewer was very appreciative of our online Directory of Latin Masses, and said that he and his wife frequently came to London, and one of the reasons was the abundance of Masses in Latin. It was fortunate for me that they had chosen the Solemnity (in the City of Westminster) of St Edward the Confessor and I was able to report that I had celebrated the feast at the 10.30am low Mass in Latin at Westminster Cathedral in the morning, the daily Mass in Latin being a feature of the life of the Cathedral.

The Extraordinary Faith programmes may be seen at extraordinaryfaith.tv , and the one in question is due to be broadcast later this year.

Book Review

Lumen Christi Missal, according to the Roman Missal, Third edition. Approved for use in the Dioceses of the United States of America. Illuminare Publications \$28.95

This very substantial book (it weighs 2½ lbs) is essentially an English-Latin Missal, rather than a Latin-English one. It is a handsome production, stoutly bound in glossy scarlet boards. It contains Lectionary readings and antiphons, the sung Order of Mass, a full Kyrie in Latin and English, simple proper and seasonal chants, and various devotional prayers. The Editor is Adam Bartlett, who also contributes (I assume, though it is not signed) an introduction outlining the rationale behind the production of the book, with pastoral directives and a guide to the musical notation, which is of the traditional four-line square neume type, both for Latin and English. This contrasts with the

approach taken in the CTS Missal, where (in the admittedly small number of chants included) the Latin notation is the traditional one but for the English a five line ‘oval blob’ notation is used.

The pattern for the Mass propers is as follows: the Introit appears in English and Latin, without chants, these being given (English only) in a ‘Simple Gradual’ at the end of the book. The readings (from the *Lectionary for Mass for use in the Dioceses of the USA*), responsorial psalm and Alleluia (those two with chant) are in English only, while the Offertory and Communion antiphons are treated in the same way as the Introit. The Proper of the Season thus takes up the greater part of the book – 723 pages – while the Proper of Saints occupies only 76. The chants given for the Order of Mass (with a grey edge to its pages to make it easier to find) is almost entirely in English only, with just a few bits (*Mortem tuam, Pater noster*) in Latin. There follow four English chant settings of the Ordinary with music, five Latin ones from the *Kyriale Simplex*, then nine from the *Kyriale* proper (*Lux et Origo* etc), and finally *Credo* I and III in both languages. All the texts in the Latin settings have an English translation - explanatory, not for singing - in small italics underneath. The various oddments collected at the back of the book include the Stations of the Cross with the *Stabat Mater* in Latin and English.

I hope this gives readers enough information to judge whether this Missal would be useful in a particular liturgical situation. Latin is there, but in a markedly subsidiary position, and unlike with the CTS Missal a strong impression is given that though Latin may not infrequently be sung, it is never *spoken*. This is certainly not the way this reviewer, or this Association, would like to see things going. Having said that, this is a very well organised and well printed book, and it is undoubtedly proving its usefulness in many American parishes.

CF

Silver Jubilee

Congratulations to ALL member, and host to Association meetings, Canon Peter Newby, parish priest of St Mary Moorfields and St Joseph Bunhill Row, London, who this year celebrates the Silver Jubilee of his ordination to the priesthood. The occasion was marked on 17 March by a sung Mass at St Mary's, which Canon Peter concelebrated with many priest friends. A group of excellent singers directed by Simon Lloyd sang the *Missa Congratulamini mihi* by Lassus, with the motets *Cantate Domino* and *Adoramus te Christe* by Monteverdi. The Mass was followed by a reception in the crypt of the church.

Appeal for use of a Laser Printer

The Association needs to continue to print and sell its Sung Mass booklets, and print-on-demand services do not seem to be geared up for this sort of production. To facilitate this work, we are hoping to find a member with a good laser printer, who would be willing to produce them. The quantities involved are not large, and the ALL would of course defray the cost of inks and any postage involved. If you can help the Association in this way, please contact the Editor.

‘When Mass is said in English’

English translations of the Mass have been in the news for quite a while now, and we think this the perfect opportunity to put before readers a facsimile of part of the very first appearance of English in the Mass, in 1965. It was not yet time for the *Novus Ordo*, and at first only limited amounts of English appeared, the Canon particularly being still *sotto voce* and in Latin. What is really remarkable here is the nature of the English used. If things had continued thus, what a different story there might have been! For those who were not around at the time, the full shock of the arrival from America of ICEL’s version can only be gauged by comparing it with this. How fondly one now looks at that relative clause in the *Agnus Dei*, and how curious it is to see ‘And with you’ for *Et cum spiritu tuo*, soon to become the tautological ‘And also with you’, which we were subsequently obliged to use, for so many years.

CF

When Mass is said in English

Celebrant: Let us pray.
Mindful of our Saviour's bidding, and of the prayer he taught us,
we take heart and say:

Extendit manus.

All: Our Father, who art in heaven,
Hallowed be thy name.
Thy kingdom come.
Thy will be done on earth, as it is in heaven,
Give us this day our daily bread.
And forgive us our trespasses,
As we forgive them that trespass against us.
And lead us not into temptation,
But deliver us from evil.

Deinde, manibus extensis, celebrans cantat vel clara voce dicit:

Celebrant: Deliver us, we pray thee, Lord,
From every evil, past, present, and to come;
And at the intercession of the blessed and glorious
Ever-virgin Mary, Mother of God,
Of thy blessed apostles Peter and Paul,
Of Andrew, and of all the saints,
Grant, of thy goodness, peace in our days,
So that, with thy merciful help,
We may be ever free from sin and safe from all disquiet:

*Discooperit calicem, genuflectit, surgit, submittit patenam hostiæ, accipit
hostiam, et eam super calicem tenens utraque manu, frangit per medium,
dicens:*

Through the same Jesus Christ, thy Son, our Lord,

*Et mediam partem, quam in dextera manu tenet, ponit super patenam.
Deinde ex parte, quæ in sinistra remanserat, frangit particulam, dicens:*

Who lives and reigns with thee
In the unity of the Holy Spirit, God:

*Aliam mediam partem, quam in sinistra manu habet, adiungit mediæ super
patenam positæ, et particulam parvam dextera retinens super calicem,
quem sinistra per nodum infra cuppam tenet, dicit:*

World without end.

People: Amen.

Cum ipsa particula signat ter super calicem, dicens:

Celebrant: The peace ✠ of the Lord be ✠ always with ✠ you.

People: And with you.

Particulam ipsam immitit in calicem, dicens secreto:

Celebrant: Hæc commixtio, et consecratio Corporis et Sanguinis Domini nostri Iesu Christi, fiat accipientibus nobis in vitam æternam. Amen.

Cooperit calicem, genuflectit et surgit. Sequitur Agnus Dei, quod, si a populo vel a schola cantatur vel recitatur, celebrans privatim non dicit; potest tamen illud una cum populo vel schola cantare vel recitare, iunctis manibus, et ter pectus percutiens. Si vero a populo vel a schola non cantatur, celebrans illud clara voce dicit inclinatus Sacramento, iunctis manibus, et ter pectus percutiens.

All: Lamb of God, who takest away the sins of the world,
have mercy on us.

Lamb of God, who takest away the sins of the world,
have mercy on us.

Lamb of God, who takest away the sins of the world,
grant us peace.

In Masses for the dead instead of the invocation "have mercy on us" all say:

Grant them rest.

Grant them rest.

Grant them eternal rest.



ASSOCIATION FOR LATIN LITURGY
*Under the Patronage of the Bishops' Conference
of England and Wales*

**PUBLICATIONS
ORDER FORM**

Ref: LL147
Date: April 2015

Qty	Publication	Price	Total
	Adoremus <i>10 or more – less 15%</i>	£1.50	
	A Voice for All Time	£6.00	
	A New Approach to Latin for the Mass – 2nd Edition	£12.00	
	CD <i>Orate Fratres</i>	£12.00	
	Latin Gregorian Chant Mass booklets: <i>£17.50 per 50, any mix</i>		
	<i>Lux et origo</i> (Mass I)	75p	
	<i>Cunctipotens genitor Deus</i> (Mass IV)	75p	
	<i>Kyrie magnae</i> (Mass V)	75p	
	<i>De angelis</i> (Mass VIII)	75p	
	<i>Cum iubilo</i> (Mass IX)	75p	
	<i>Orbis factor</i> (Mass XI)	75p	
	<i>Advent & Lent</i> (Mass XVII)	75p	
	<i>Requiem</i>	75p	
	Organ Accompaniment to <i>Missa de angelis</i>	£5.00	
	Plainsong for Parishes — CD	£12.00	
	Latin Mass Directory – <i>available only at: www.latin-liturgy.org</i>		
	Prices include UK postage. For overseas postage add 25%. If paying by foreign currency, please add equivalent of £10 to cover conversion costs.		

*Cheques etc should be crossed and made payable to
Association for Latin Liturgy*

Total £

Send to:

From (please PRINT):

Association for Latin Liturgy

47 Western Park Road
LEICESTER
LE3 6HQ
United Kingdom

☎ 0116 285 6158

e-mail Sales@Latin-Liturgy.org

website www.Latin-Liturgy.org

Association for Latin Liturgy **Cash Receipts & Payments for the year 6 April 2013 to 5 April 2014**

Receipts		Payments	
2012/13	2013/14	2012/13	2013/14
£	£	£	£
2,788 Subscriptions	1,775	268 Council Members' Travelling expenses	78
105 Donations	100	237 Printing of publications/stock purchase	343
309 Sales of Publications/Compact discs	307	0 General Postage	430
725 Meetings	579	148 Banking	0
5 Bank Interest	5	66 Internet costs/software	183
31 Royalties	45	830 <i>Latin Liturgy</i>	673
0 Income Tax Repayments	0	1,879 Meetings	2,329
0 Miscellaneous	0	135 Advertising/Promotion	231
3,963 Total receipts	2,812	3,563 Total payments	4,266
3,963	2,812	400 Difference between receipts & payments	-1,454
		<u>3,963</u>	<u>2,812</u>

Cash capital	£
Opening balance at 6 April 2013	11,139
Profit (-Loss) for the year	-1,454
Closing balance at 5 April 2014	9,685

Report by the Treasurer:

I certify that the above Cash Receipts & Payments Account and Cash Capital Balance Sheet have both been prepared in accordance with the books and vouchers of the Association.

Bernard Marriott (Treasurer)

ASSOCIATION FOR LATIN LITURGY

Founded in 1969 to encourage and extend the use of Latin
in the liturgy of the Catholic Church

Under the patronage of the
Bishops' Conference of England & Wales

Officers of the Association

Chairman Christopher Francis
 16 Brean Down Avenue
 Bristol BS9 4JF
 Christopher.Francis@Latin-Liturgy.org

Vice-Chairman This position is currently vacant

Treasurer Bernard Marriott
 47 Western Park Road, Leicester LE3 6HQ
 Bernard.Marriott@Latin-Liturgy.org

Membership Brendan Daintith
 173 Davidson Road
 Croydon CR0 6DP
 Brendan.Daintith@Latin-Liturgy.org

Members of the Association's Council
 Fr Kevin Hale, Mgr Bruce Harbert,
 Graeme Jolly, Fr Guy Nicholls Cong Orat,
 Alastair Tocher, Fr Anton Webb Cong Orat, Ben Whitworth

Website www.Latin-Liturgy.org

Latin Liturgy Editor: Christopher Francis

Orders for publications should be sent to:

ALL
47 Western Park Road
Leicester LE3 6HQ
or
Sales@Latin-Liturgy.org

'Latin Liturgy' No 147 copyright © 2015 Association for Latin Liturgy, except where
otherwise acknowledged. Reproduction, by whatever means,
requires written permission.